

THE TOWN AND COUNTRY PLANNING ACT 1990

Appeal by: Network Space Development Limited

Planning Inspectorate Reference: APP/R4408/W/24/3341097

BMBC reference: 2022/0115

**Appeal site: Land north of Shaw Lane, Carlton, Barnsley,
S71 3HH**

Appeal against the refusal of: Residential development of up to 215 dwellings with associated car parking/garages, landscaping, public open space including both equipped and non-equipped areas of play, SUDS and drainage, with details of a new vehicular access onto Shaw Lane (Outline with all matters reserved apart from means of access)

**PROOF OF EVIDENCE OF EMMA COVENEY, SENIOR
PLANNING OFFICER (MRTPI)**

ON BEHALF OF

BARNSELY METROPOLITAN BOROUGH COUNCIL

JULY 2024

Contents

.....	1
1. Introduction and Scope of Evidence	3
2. Main Issues.....	3
3. Executive Summary	4
4. The Council’s Case.....	5
Housing Requirement	5
Deliverable Housing Supply	7
Sites with planning permission for fewer than 10 dwellings.....	9
Overall Five Year Housing Supply Conclusion	12
5. Weighting and Conclusions	13
Appendix 1: Five Year Housing Land Supply Delivery Assumptions	14
Appendix 2: NPPF Category A&B Sites (please see separate PDF document).....	14
Appendix 3: Housing Trajectory 2024 Update – Local Plan Allocations (please see separate PDF document).....	14
Appendix 4: Housing Trajectory 2024 Update – Non Allocated Large Sites With Planning Permission (please see separate PDF document)	14

LIST OF DOCUMENTS REFERRED TO (CD Ref):

- 1.1 NATIONAL PLANNING POLICY FRAMEWORK (2023)
- 1.2 DHLUC PLANNING PRACTICE GUIDANCE
- 3.1 BARNSELEY LOCAL PLAN (2019)
- 3.2 BARNSELEY LOCAL PLAN, INSPECTORS REPORT (2018)
- 5.1 CARLTON MASTERPLAN FRAMEWORK
- 5.2 CARLTON MASTERPLAN FRAMEWORK DELIVERY STRATEGY
- 5.5 BARNSELEY LOCAL PLAN MONITORING REPORT 2022/23
- 5.6 BARNSELEY FIVE YEAR DELIVERABLE HOUSING LAND SUPPLY REPORT (APRIL 2021 – MARCH 2026)

1. Introduction and Scope of Evidence

1. I am Emma Coveney. I hold a First Class BA(Hons) Geography degree from the University of Liverpool (1997-2000), an RTPI accredited Post Graduate Diploma of Town and Regional Planning Studies and a Masters in Planning Research from the University of Sheffield (2001-2003). I completed the Barnsley Leadership Programme in 2018 and am a Chartered Member of the RTPI. I currently hold the post of Senior Planning Officer employed by Barnsley Metropolitan Borough Council in the Planning Policy Team of the Council's Regeneration and Culture Service.
2. I have worked in the Planning Policy Team since January 2004 dealing with a range of topics and projects, including the current Local Plan and the associated Examination process. I am currently the Planning Policy lead for housing, including monitoring delivery of sites.
3. I have had limited involvement with the Masterplan Framework production and planning application process for this site. I have reviewed all the relevant material considerations associated with the scope of this proof of evidence.

2. Main Issues

4. My evidence will focus on the housing delivery element of the inquiry and will set out how the Council has arrived at the current estimated five year housing land position with a base date of 1 April 2024.
5. A topic based Statement of Common Ground – Five Year Housing Land Supply has been agreed between the Council and the Appellants. The statement sets out background relevant to the housing supply aspect of the Inquiry in paragraphs 6 to 9. It sets out the overall matters of agreement and disagreement in paragraphs 10 to 14 and table 1.
6. My evidence will reference the appropriate policy documents and strategies, and draw on the Council's published monitoring documents, including the five year housing supply position and Local Plan monitoring reports as set out on page 2. It will also draw on updated monitoring data to provide an indication of what we believe the updated housing supply position to be. This will reflect data to the 2023/2024 monitoring year.
7. The evidence that I have prepared and provide for this appeal is true and has been prepared and is given in accordance with the guidance of my professional institution. I can confirm that the opinions expressed are my true and professional opinions.

3. Executive Summary

8. A topic specific 'Statement of Common Ground – Five Year Housing Land Supply' (SoCG) has been agreed by the Council and the Appellant. It is agreed that for the purposes of this inquiry only, the Council cannot identify a five year housing land supply. The Council therefore accepts that the 'tilted balance' is engaged. However, the Council and the Appellant do not agree on the basis of determining the housing requirement, or the five year housing land supply figure for the period 2024/25 to 2028/29.
9. The Council sets out its position in section 4 below, detailing the Housing requirement and estimated five year housing land supply for the period 2024/25 to 2028/29, and the assumptions used in determining that position.
10. In determining the housing requirement, the Council considers that:
 - the shortfall in housing delivery since the start of the plan period is to be recovered over the Local Plan period, in line with the 'Liverpool methodology', as was determined appropriate by the Local Plan Inspector at paragraph 245 of the report of the examination (Core Document 3.2); and
 - given the current Housing Delivery Test measurement is passed, no additional buffer is required.
11. Section 4 goes on to demonstrate how the Council has arrived at its estimated five year land supply position at the base date of 1 April 2024, following what it considers to be a sound approach. The Council concludes that 5589 net dwellings can be delivered against a requirement of 7676 net dwellings, equating to a 3.6 years supply. Other external factors that are impacting housing delivery both nationally and within Barnsley are also referenced, and it is confirmed that housebuilding remains a key Council objective with work underway to unlock sites and move ongoing applications to determination.
12. Whilst the Council and the Appellant do not agree on the five year housing land supply figure for the period 2024/25 to 2028/29, it is agreed that the weight to be attached to the delivery of housing is substantial.

4. The Council's Case

13. The Council and the Appellant are in agreement that for the purposes of this inquiry only, the Council cannot identify a five year housing land supply. The Council therefore accepts that the 'tilted balance' is engaged. However, the Council and the Appellant do not agree on the basis of determining the requirement, or the five year housing land supply figure for the period 2024/25 to 2028/29. The following paragraphs set out how the Council has arrived at its position.
14. The Council's estimated housing land supply position has been determined making use of the methodology for assessing its deliverable five year housing land supply set out in Core Document 5.6 Barnsley Five Year Deliverable Housing Land Supply Report (April 2021-March 2026). The methodology is not repeated here. The following paragraphs provide updated information with regard to the base date of 1 April 2024.

Housing Requirement

15. The Council considers that the housing requirement for the period 2024/25 to 2028/29 is 7676 dwellings, having accounted for shortfall in housing delivery against housing requirement since the start of the plan period and consideration of whether an additional buffer should be applied.

Approach to dealing with shortfall

16. Table 1 below sets out net housing completions compared to annual housing requirement from the start of the plan period.

Table 1: Net housing completions April 2014 – March 2024

Year	Gross dwellings	Losses	Net requirement	Net completions	Difference between requirement and delivery
2014/15	644	22	1134	622	-512
2015/16	740	34	1134	706	-428
2016/17	872	16	1134	856	-278
2017/18	1037	29	1134	1008	-126
2018/19	1028	40	1134	988	-146
2019/20	1066	15	1134	1051	-83
2020/21	595	7	1134	588	-546
2021/22	598	4	1134	594	-540
2022/23	696	11	1134	685	-449
2023/24	642	7	1134	635	-499
Total					-3611

17. Table 1 shows that there has been a shortfall of 3611 against the annual requirement since the start of the plan period. This shortfall will be recovered over the plan period of the Local Plan, in line with the 'Liverpool Methodology'. The Liverpool method was determined appropriate by the Local Plan Inspector at paragraph 245 of the report of the examination (Core Document 3.2).
18. This equates to an additional 401 dwellings per annum being added to the remaining 9 years of the plan period, increasing the net requirement for the period 2024/2025 to 2028/2029 by 2005 dwellings. Table 2 below illustrates the calculation.

Table 2: Housing Requirement 2023/24 to 2027/28 - Liverpool method

Year	Net requirement	Adjusted net requirement (Backlog 14/15 – 23/24)*
2024/25	1134	1535
2025/26	1134	1535
2026/27	1134	1535
2027/28	1134	1535
2028/29	1134	1535
Total	5670	7676

**calculated as 3611 divided by 9 (remaining years in plan period) = 401dpa*

Housing Delivery Test Measurement (Buffer)

19. Performance against housing delivery test targets dictates whether a 20% buffer should be added to the housing requirement with a 20% buffer required if delivery falls to 85% or below. The appellants asserted housing requirement figure of 1.8 years is based on the addition of a 20% buffer, as set out in table 1 of the Statement of Common Ground. However, the NPPF is clear at paragraph 80 that until new Housing Delivery Test results are published, the previously published results should be used. Barnsley's latest published Housing Delivery Test measurement was 102%, on this basis, no additional buffer is required.

Deliverable Housing Supply

20. The Council has estimated that it has a five year deliverable net supply of 5589 for the period 2024/25 to 2028/29, summarised in table 3 below.

Table 7: Barnsley Five Year Supply Summary (2024/25 to 2028/29)

Five Year Supply Summary	
Category	Deliverable Dwellings
Non allocated planning permissions > 10 dwellings	239
Non allocated planning permissions < 10 dwellings (assumption)	310
Local Plan allocations and planning permissions on local plan allocations	4454
Windfall Allowance	631
Five Year Deliverable Supply Total	5634
Predicted Losses	45
Five Year Deliverable Net Supply Total	5589

*Predicted losses arrived at by calculating the average of losses from the last 5 years of the plan period set out in table 1. That gives a figure of 9 per annum which is then multiplied by 5.

21. The deliverable supply can be broken down to reflect NPPF category A and category B sites as follows.

Source	Deliverable Dwellings from NPPF Category A sites	Deliverable Dwellings from NPPF Category B sites
Non allocated planning permissions > 10 dwellings	200	39
Non allocated planning permissions < 10 dwellings (assumption)	310	n/a
Local Plan allocations and planning permissions on Local Plan allocations	1814	2640

Appendix 2 provides a list of the relevant sites and the associated supply anticipated in the five year supply period base date 1 April 2024.

Local Plan Allocation and Sites with Planning Permission for more than 10 dwellings

22. The Council has estimated supply from Local Plan allocations (with and without permission) and large non allocated sites with planning permission based on the assumptions set out in Core Document 5.6, paragraphs 12 to 16 and summarised in appendix 1 of this proof. The projections are based on the latest understood position, updated as appropriate following an officer assessment group including colleagues from planning and housing using their local knowledge.
23. Appendices 3 and 4 show an updated housing trajectory (base date 1 April 2024) for Local Plan Allocations (with and without planning permission) and non allocated large sites with planning permission, respectively. The relevant five year supply period is shaded green.

Sites with planning permission for fewer than 10 dwellings

24. It is not practical to assess deliverability on small sites with less than 10 dwellings on a site by site basis therefore an evidentially derived discount has been used as set out in appendix 1 regarding non implementation rates. Using past completion data, it has been assumed that 62 dwellings per annum will be completed on small sites.

Windfalls

25. The Council's five year land supply includes a predictive windfall allowance amended each year reflecting a rolling five year pattern based on the most recent past performance to ensure robust and up to date. The methodology for calculating the allowance is set out in Core Document 5.6, paragraphs 19 to 24.
26. The number of full and reserved matters windfall dwellings granted, on new sites, in the last five years is shown in table 3 below.

Table 4: Windfall dwellings (Full and Reserved Matters)

Year granted	Windfall Dwellings
2019/20	207
2020/21	190
2021/22	352
2022/23	185
2023/24	112
Annual average of the last 5 years Total granted over last 5 years (2019/2020 to 2023/2024) = 1046 1046/5 = 209 five year average	

27. The methodology takes an average of the last five years to arrive at an estimate that 209 windfalls will be granted each year up to 2028/29. Evidence shows what percentage of windfalls granted were built out in the subsequent 5 years (Build Out % in table 5 below). When this is applied cumulatively 66% of those granted were built out in 5 years, 6% of those granted were built out in 4 years, 6% in 3 years, 2% in 2 years and 2% in 1 year. When these percentages are applied to the annual 209 windfall figure, we get a total of 624 new windfall dwellings expected over the next five years. This is demonstrated in table 4 below.

Table 5: Build out rates

Year	Windfalls	Yearly Build Out					Build out % (Cumulative)	Build out
		2024/25	2025/26	2026/27	2027/28	2028/29		
2024/25	209	105.573	12.163	12.163	3.406	3.892	51 (66)	137.196
2025/26	209		105.573	12.163	12.163	3.406	6 (64)	133.304
2026/27	209			105.573	12.163	12.163	6 (62)	129.899
2027/28	209				105.573	12.163	2 (56)	117.736
2028/29	209					105.573	2 (51)	105.573
Totals		105.573	117.736	129.899	133.304	137.196		623.708

28. Calculating the number of windfall outline planning permissions on new sites is determined by analysis of the number of completions associated with outline planning permissions completed in the last five years. For outline windfalls a much lower total build out rate of 20% is assumed. This analysis is shown in table 6 below.

Table 6: Windfall dwellings (Outline)

Year Granted	Windfall Dwellings
2019/20	15
2020/21	10
2021/22	2
2022/23	3
2023/24	5
Average of the last five years outline permissions Total permissions in the last five years (2019/2024 to 2023/2024) = 35 $110/5 = 7$ average granted per annum	

29. Based on the last 5 years data there would be an average of 7 granted per annum. This gives a total of 35 dwellings over the five year period. Assuming a much lower total build out rate of 20% this would give a figure of 7 dwellings.
30. The total windfall allowance assumed for the 2024/25 to 2028/29 five year period is therefore 631 dwellings.

Losses

31. Predicted losses are amended each year reflecting a rolling 5 year average using the most recent past data to ensure robust and up to date. The average of losses is calculated from the last 5 years of the plan period set out in table 1. That gives a figure of 9 per annum which is then multiplied by 5.
32. Table 7 below summarises the five year supply situation in Barnsley for the period 2024/25 to 2028/29.

Overall Five Year Housing Supply Conclusion

33. The Councils overall conclusion on five year deliverable housing supply is set out in box 1 below.

Box 1: Barnsley's Five Year Housing Supply Position for the period 2024/25 to 2028/29

Five year net housing requirement = 7676 dwellings

Five Year deliverable net supply = 5589 dwellings

In conclusion, 5589 net dwellings can be delivered against a requirement of 7676 net dwellings. This equates to 3.6 years supply.

34. As discussed in paragraphs 76-80 of the latest Authority Monitoring Report for 2022/23 (Core Document 5.5), housing delivery in Barnsley has not yet reached the levels anticipated when the Local plan was adopted. The national economic picture has changed since the adoption of the Local Plan in January 2019 with a clear impact from the COVID-19 pandemic, the subsequent cost of living crisis and other macro-economic factors. Covid-19, Brexit and more latterly inflation have resulted in higher interest rates which have impacted on the housing market, resulting in a prolonged period of turbulence. The cost of living crisis, increase in materials and hike in interest rates have had an impact on the housing market and delivery. High inflation and rising interest rates are adversely affecting confidence and limiting the amount people are able to borrow.
35. Other factors have also impacted housing delivery including statutory consultee holding directions and non-conformity with Local plan policies and adopted Masterplan Frameworks. There has been a National Highways change in position. The publication of circular 1/22 is now being referred to by National Highways who are placing greater emphasis on Local Council's consideration of the impact on strategic road networks and the delivery of sustainable development. This initially resulted in a large number of holding directions being issued until developers had carried out significant levels of transport modelling, consequently slowing progress on a number of sites. These holding directions have now been lifted.
36. In addition, the Council has acted to assist developers since adoption of the Local Plan by adopting masterplan frameworks for some of its larger allocations. In some cases, these masterplans have been drawn up in collaboration with

developers and landowners, yet a number of planning applications that are not in conformity with the frameworks are being submitted, resulting in further delay.

37. However, the Council's newly published Housing Strategy (2024-2028) confirms that housebuilding remains one of the Council's key objectives. Work is underway to unlock a range of Local Plan sites to accelerate housing delivery across the borough, and to move live planning applications to determination. In addition, the Council's New Build and Acquisitions Strategy sets out an ambitious £43M programme to deliver 200 new affordable homes over the next five years. Officers are also exploring a range of alternative delivery mechanisms for Council-owned assets to maximise market and affordable housing delivery.
38. Homes England and the South Yorkshire Mayoral Combined Authority (SYMCA) have committed to entering into a Strategic Place Partnership, designed to support sub-regions with the most ambitious proposals for housing growth. As part of this Partnership, the Council is part of a 'Housing Pipeline Project' led by Cushman and Wakefield in part to enable an increase of housing delivery across the sub-region, including accelerating housing delivery on Local Plan and Masterplan Framework sites in Barnsley. The Carlton Masterplan Framework sites MU2 and MU3 have been identified as 'amber - challenging but deliverable sites' which alongside MU5 at Royston constitute a suggested catalyst site with an additional funding commitment from SYMCA and Homes England to accelerate delivery strategies. Prioritisation of internal resources will allow the coordination of steering groups and drive forward pre applications/planning applications in the short-term.

5. Weighting and Conclusions

39. The topic based Statement of Common Ground – Five Year Housing Land Supply confirms the agreed position with regard to five year housing land supply. It is agreed that for the purposes of this inquiry, the Council cannot identify a five year housing land supply and the 'tilted balance' is engaged.
40. My evidence has set out how the Council has arrived at its estimated five year land supply position at the base date of 1 April 2024, following what it considers to be a sound approach. It has also referenced other external factors that are impacting housing delivery both nationally and within Barnsley and confirmed that housebuilding remains a key Council objective with work underway to unlock sites and move ongoing applications to determination.
41. Whilst the Council and the Appellant do not agree on the five year housing land supply figure for the period 2024/25 to 2028/29, it is agreed that the weight to be attached to the delivery of housing is substantial.

Appendix 1: Five Year Housing Land Supply Delivery Assumptions

Assumptions	
Delivery rates	Starting point: sites below 20ha 45 dwellings per annum Starting point: sites over 20ha likely to be built out by at least two developers 90 dwellings per annum. Higher build out rates have been assumed on some of the mixed use sites given they are larger in scale
Pre-build lead-in times	Sites with full planning permission granted after 1 April 2014 will not deliver any dwellings until at least year 2 following grant of permission. Sites with outline planning permission granted after 1 April 2014 or which are likely to be granted planning permission imminently will not deliver any dwellings until at least year 3 following grant of planning permission. Former Green Belt sites will not deliver any dwellings until at least year 3 following grant of planning permission. Delivery on sites with extant planning permission is taken from research carried out as part of the five year supply monitoring taking account of (average) site specific delivery rates, and units under construction as appropriate.
Non implementation rates	An evidentially derived discount (60% build out rate) for non-delivery is applied to small sites (under 10 dwellings) Lapsed permissions are removed at each update.

Appendix 2: NPPF Category A&B Sites (please see separate PDF document)

Appendix 3: Housing Trajectory 2024 Update – Local Plan Allocations (please see separate PDF document)

Appendix 4: Housing Trajectory 2024 Update – Non Allocated Large Sites With Planning Permission (please see separate PDF document)