



Alternative Site Assessment Addendum

Application for the Development of Houghton Main Renewable Energy Centre (REC) comprising a Timber Resource Recovery Centre (TRRC) and Associated Infrastructure

Land located off Houghton Main Colliery Roundabout, Park Spring Road, Houghton Main, Barnsley

Peel Environmental Management (UK) Limited and Houghton Main Waste Limited

CRM.066.004



Contact Details:

Enzygo Ltd.
The Granary
Woodend Lane
Cromhall
Gloucestershire
GL12 8AA

tel: 01454 269237
fax: 01454 269760
email: lee.searles@enzygo.com
www: enzygo.com

Alternative Site Assessment

Application for the Development of Houghton Main Renewable Energy Centre comprising a Timber Resource Recovery Centre and Associated Infrastructure

Project:	CRM.066.004
Location:	Land located off Houghton Main Colliery Roundabout, Park Spring Road, Houghton Main, Barnsley
For:	Peel Environmental Management (UK) Limited and Houghton Main Waste Limited
Status:	Final
Date:	February 2015
Author:	Bethany Kington Planning Consultant
Reviewer:	Lee Searles Planning Director

Disclaimer:

This report has been produced by Enzygo Limited within the terms of the contract with the client and taking account of the resources devoted to it by agreement with the client.

We disclaim any responsibility to the client and others in respect of any matters outside the scope of the above.

This report is confidential to the client and we accept no responsibility of whatsoever nature to third parties to whom this report, or any part thereof, is made known. Any such party relies on the report at their own risk.



Contents

1 Introduction	2
2 Assessment.....	3
3 Summary and Conclusion.....	10

Tables & Figures

Table 1. Additional sites within the Borough.....	3
Table 2. Assessment Results for Phase 2	6

Appendices

Appendix 1- Alternative Site Assessment for application 2014/0559

Appendix 2- Stage 1 assessment



1 Introduction

1.1 Alternative Site Assessment

- 1.1.1 In May 2014 an Alternative Site Assessment (ASA) was carried out to examine whether there were any sites potentially available which would perform better than the site selected for the proposed development contained in planning application 2014/0559 (see Appendix 1).
- 1.1.2 This assessment was based on the development of a Timber Resource Recovery Centre (TRRC) facility.
- 1.1.3 The development has since been amended, and no longer includes the Anaerobic Digestion facility. Therefore the minimum size required for the proposed development site has decreased to approximately 3.0 ha.
- 1.1.4 In light of this the ASA has been reviewed to see if any of the sites from the May 2014 assessment which were discredited on size would now be appropriate. This addendum will also consider any new sites which have been identified since the assessment was carried out.
- 1.1.5 The same methodology has been adopted as in May 2014, as agreed with Barnsley Metropolitan Borough Council planning officers. This is described in detail in the original ASA, which can be found in Appendix 1.

2 Assessment

2.1 Minimum Size Threshold

2.1.1 The minimum site area required for the development has been agreed with the applicant and project architects. This has been set at 3 hectares (ha).

2.2 Sources of Site Information

2.2.1 In the original ASA the geographical extent of the assessment was set as the Barnsley Borough. Based on the same geographical extent, the following sources have been used to identify potential alternative sites:

1. Existing waste sites within the Barnsley, Doncaster and Rotherham Joint Waste Plan (JWP)
2. New sites allocated in the Barnsley, Doncaster and Rotherham JWP.
3. Sites allocated for employment and industrial use in the Barnsley Unitary Development Plan (UDP).
4. Sites allocated as employment sites in the Local Plan Consultation Draft (2014)

2.2.2 Only sites which need to be reconsidered in the light of the changed site requirement or which are additional to those already considered in the original ASA have been included in this assessment.

2.2.3 Based on the above sources of information a number of new sites have been identified. These are listed in Table 1.

Table 1. Additional sites within the Borough

Source	Site	Area	Size (Ha)
Unitary Development Plan (2000)	Downings Steel, Doncaster Road	Barnsley Urban Community Area	3.2
	West Road/ Stocks Lane		3.3
	Twibell Street		3.2
Local Plan Consultation Draft (2014)	Birthwaite Business Park	Urban Barnsley	3.5
	Capitol Park Extension		5.43
	Capitol Park		9.02
	Bleachcroft Way Industrial Estate		9.31
	Land South Of Barugh Green Road	Barnsley	50

	Land Off Ferrymoor Way	Cudworth	16.96
	Land South Of Dearne Valley Parkway	Goldthorpe	43.36
	Land South Of Dearne Valley Parkway		128
	Thurnscoe Business Park		5.96
	Land West Of Sheffield Road		Holyland
	Rockingham	18.76	
	Shortwood Extension	11.81	
	Shortwood Business Park	3.75	
	Land South Of Dearne Valley Parkway	31.6	
	Ashroyds	11.37	
	Land North Of Sheffield Road	Penistone	
	Everill Gate Lane	Wombwell	3.58
	Wentworth Industrial Park, Tankersley	Outside Principal Towns	4.35
	Land East Of Park Springs Road, Houghton		8.6
Joint Waste Plan (2012)	Grange Lane, Stairfoot	Barnsley	3.4
	Wroot Road Quarry, Finningley	Doncaster	3
	Brier Hills Farm, Throne	Doncaster	3
	Eastwood, Parkgate	Rotherham	4.8
	Rotherham Road, Beighton	Rotherham	N/A

2.3 Stage 1- High Level Site Sieving

- 2.3.1 A high level site assessment was carried out on the 27 sites listed in Table 1 (see Appendix 2). This identified that 18 of the 19 sites in the Local Plan Consultation Draft are available for employment, based on the Draft Employment Land Review (2014). The 128 ha of 'Land South of Dearne Valley Parkway' is not available for permanent development.
- 2.3.2 The three sites identified in the UDP are not included in the Draft Employment Land Review, and therefore are considered to no longer be available for employment.

2.4 Further Consideration of Strategic Waste Sites

- 2.4.1 Further specific consideration of the four strategic waste management sites allocated in policy WCS3 of the Barnsley Doncaster Rotherham Joint Waste Plan is set out below.
- 2.4.2 **Site 3.1 – Sandall Stones Road, Kirk Sandall (Doncaster)** – The site is 2ha in size and the indicated potential capacity is only 120,000 tonnes per annum. The minimum site requirement for the proposed REC is 3.0 hectares given the scale of the REC is 150,000 tonnes per annum. The mitigation identified in Table 9 of the Joint Waste Plan relates to the site’s proximity to the Sherwood Sandstone aquifer and sensitive receptors. For the key reason of insufficient site size and capacity, the site is discounted.
- 2.4.3 **Site 3.2 – Hatfield Power Park, Stainforth (Doncaster)** – The 16 ha Hatfield Power Park is no longer the subject of interest in delivering the local Barnsley, Doncaster, Rotherham PFI waste management contract. The land identified in the Joint Waste Plan has already been permitted for waste reception and materials recycling facility including ancillary buildings (reference 10/01175/REMM – a certificate of lawful development was granted in relation to this on 12th May 2014). The significant infrastructure investment required to deliver the wider area’s development potential (The Joint Waste Plan (Table 9) identifies the need for a road link to the M18 and improvements in flood defences as well as other development constraints) remains to be delivered as part of a comprehensive development already being promoted for the wider Hatfield site (i.e not the allocated site). For the purposes of viable development of the proposed REC at this time, this would render this site strongly constrained. The mitigation identified in Table 9 of the Joint Waste Plan relates to the need to avoid acid deposition from waste management uses on the Thorne Moor Special Area of Conservation. For the reasons outlined above, the site is discounted.
- 2.4.4 **Site 3.3 – Bolton Road, Manvers (Rotherham)** – The Bolton Road, Manvers Site is already being taken up by BDR for the development of its municipal waste management facilities. The site is therefore unavailable for alternative waste management uses. For this reason, the site is discounted.
- 2.4.5 **Site 3.4 – Aldwarke Steel Works, Parkgate (Rotherham)** – The 5 ha Aldwarke Steel Works is a reserve new site for strategic waste management uses. Table 9 of the Joint Waste Plan identifies the infrastructure requirements and timescale for development of the site. These include the provision of rail and river access (via river wharf and railhead) to handle bulk waste. Whilst assessed as suitable for waste management uses, the site does not fit with the proposed REC development as applied for, for two main reasons:
- The TRRC will operate as a local/sub-regional facility drawing on a small number of suppliers who would deliver materials by road and who would be unlikely to be able to utilise rail or river access. The use of river or rail access to the site would most likely be based on the transfer of waste from a single source by river or rail over the long term, most likely municipal waste.
 - The mitigation identified in Table 9 of the Joint Waste Plan relates to flood risk and views from designated historic landscapes which would constrain the development of the proposed TRRC.

2.5 Phase 2- Site Assessment on additional and reconsidered sites

2.5.1 The remaining 18 sites have been assessed in more detail to consider their suitability as alternative location for the development proposal. The assessment results for each site are set out in Table 2.

Table 2. Assessment Results for Stage 2

Site	Main Constraints	Conclusion
Birthwaite Business Park	The site is divided into two smaller sites via an access road, and is therefore less efficient in terms of accommodating the proposed development. Part of the site is adjacent to the Green Belt, and it is also on the edge of the urban area and in close proximity to residential areas. This is likely to present noise and visual impacts. The site is remote from key transport routes, as although the M1 runs alongside it, there is no junction here.	Strongly constrained
Capitol Park Extension	The site has good access to the M1 motorway network. However it is close to an Air Quality Management Area, and this could be exacerbated by the development. The site is surrounded by Green belt on two sides.	Constrained
Capitol Park	The site is divided into two sections, however this should not present an issue as the development could fit within one of the sections. The site has good access to the M1 motorway, however it is surrounded on two sides by Greenbelt.	Suitable
Bleachcroft Way Industrial Estate	The site is on the edge of the urban area and is in close proximity to residential, educational and community areas resulting in potential visual and noise concerns. The site is relatively isolated from major transport networks and would require vehicles to travel on minor roads to access the site. The site has ecologically important habitats on/ around it which would need retaining. The current site is classified as Greenfield, whereas development on a Brownfield site is preferred.	Strongly Constrained
Land South Of Barugh Green Road	The site is designated as mixed use, including for housing. This could result in visual and noise issues. The site would require extensive works including improved links to the M1 J37, diverted/relocated PRoW etc. This is beyond the scope of the development, which would only require a small portion of the site.	Strongly Constrained
Land Off Ferrymoor Way	The site is reasonably close to the motorway network with good access to the A1 and M1. Parts of the site are within Flood Zone 2 and 3, and there are ecologically valuable	Strongly Constrained

Site	Main Constraints	Conclusion
	habitats on site which would constrain the timing of construction. The site is in close proximity to residential areas which could result in visual and noise concerns. Parts of the site are adjacent to the Green Belt.	
Land South Of Dearne Valley Parkway	The site has reasonably good access to both the A1 and M1. The site lies in the edge of the urban area and is in close proximity to residential areas resulting in visual and noise impacts. The site is also close to ecologically important habitats, and it is considered that development of the site could have detrimental impacts. Parts of the site are adjacent to the Green belt.	Strongly Constrained
Thurnscoe Business Park	The site is divided into two sections by a road. However the development would fit into one section of this site. The site has reasonably good access to both the A1 and M1. The site is on the edge of an urban area and is surrounded by residential areas and a park. Therefore the development is likely to have significant visual and noise impacts.	Strongly Constrained
Land West Of Sheffield Road	The site has good access to the M1 motorway network. However it is in close proximity to a residential area and woodland, and is surrounded by Green belt on two sides. The development could create significant visual and noise concerns. The site has been identified as potentially requiring noise attenuation measures. This site is also in/very close to an AQMA. The proposed development could exacerbate this.	Strongly Constrained
Rockingham	The site is split into two sections, however the proposed development would fit into one of these sections. The site has good access to the M1 motorway network. However the site is in close proximity to residential areas resulting in visual and noise constraints.	Constrained
Shortwood Extension	The site has good access to the M1 network. Parts of the site are in close proximity to residential areas and there are views to the wider landscape which must be protected. There is also a Green Way and Public Footpath that cross the site that must be protected, and Green belt to one side. There is a major geological fault passing through the site which could present a hazard given the proposed development.	Strongly Constrained
Shortwood Business Park	The site has good access to the M1 motorway network and is reasonably removed from residential developments. There are a number of mature trees on site which need	Suitable

Site	Main Constraints	Conclusion
	protecting, and this could present difficulties depending on their location. The site is adjacent to the Green Belt on two sides.	
Land South Of Dearne Valley Parkway	The site is in good proximity to the M1 network. However it is also close to ecologically important habitats, listed buildings and residential developments. The site is in close proximity to the Green belt and wider countryside, and has a Green way, Public Footpaths and Bridleways cutting through and along the periphery of the site. These would present a difficult given the nature of the proposal. The proposed development, especially the size of the stack would have significant visual impacts. Furthermore, there is concern that vehicles would have to use routes within existing AQMAs to access the site.	Strongly Constrained
Ashroyds	The site is split into two sections. However the proposed development could fit into one of these. The site has good links to the M1 network but would need to be accessed via estate roads. The site is on the edge of the urban area and is in close proximity to residential properties on two sides. This could result in visual and noise impacts.	Strongly Constrained
Land North Of Sheffield Road	The site is reasonably isolated from the motorway network and would require access via B-roads. The site requires a buffer strip left between the development and the woodland. This reduces the size of the site which is already only just large enough. The site lies on the edge of the urban area and is adjacent to residential properties on two sides, which would create visual and noise issues. The site is surrounded by Green belt.	Strongly Constrained
Everill Gate Lane	The site is close to residential developments which would result in visual and noise impacts. The site is reasonably isolated from the motorway network and would require transportation on A roads. There is a Nature Reserve Local Wildlife Site nearby which must be considered. The site is close to, but not adjacent to Green belt.	Strongly Constrained
Wentworth Industrial Park, Tankersley	The site is split into two sections divided by a main road. This would restrict the ability to construct the proposed development on the site. The site has good access to the M1 network, however access would be required on estate roads. The site is adjacent to the Green belt, and parts of the site are vegetated. The site has been identified as having detrimental ecological impacts if developed.	Strongly Constrained



Site	Main Constraints	Conclusion
Land East Of Park Springs Road, Houghton	The site is adjacent to Green belt on three sides. Part of the site is vegetated, and this would need to be cleared prior to development. The site is in close proximity to a small number of residential properties which could present noise and visual impacts.	Suitable



3 Summary and Conclusion

- 3.1.1 This Alternative Site Assessment Addendum has been undertaken following the methodology previously agreed with BMBC planning officers. It has identified potential new sites which have either become available since the previous ASA was carried out, or would now be suitable due to changes in the site size.
- 3.1.2 A Total of 27 sites were identified. The Stage 1 study demonstrated that 9 of these were no longer considered available or suitable for the proposed development. The remaining 18 sites were subjected to further assessment. This considered how the development would affect residential areas, and other impacts such as noise, traffic and visual impacts.
- 3.1.3 Constraints were identified for all of the Stage 2 sites, and these were considered to have varying levels of significance. For the majority of the alternative sites identified, the potential for visual impacts would need to be fully assessed.
- 3.1.4 A number of sites also experience access constraints for the heavy vehicle traffic associated with the proposed development.
- 3.1.5 In light of these factors, no potential alternative sites were identified that are considered to be more suitable for the proposed development than the Houghton Main Site, which is the subject of this application.



Enzygo specialise in a wide range of technical services:

- Property and Sites**
- Waste and Mineral Planning**
- Waste Technologies and Renewables**
- Landscape and Visual Impact**
- Environmental Assessment Co-ordination**
- Hydrology and Flood Risk**
- Waste Contract Procurement**
- Noise and Vibration**
- Environmental Permitting and Regulation**
- Development Planning & Policy**
- Ecology Services**
- Contaminated Land and Geotechnical**
- Traffic and Transportation**

BRISTOL OFFICE

The Granary
Woodend Lane
Cromhall
Bristol GL12 8AA
Tel: 01454 269237
Fax: 01454 269760

kevin.parr@enzygo.com

SHEFFIELD OFFICE

STEP Business Centre
Wortley Road
Deepcar
Sheffield S36 2UH
Tel: 0114 2903677
Fax: 0114 2903688

matt.travis@enzygo.com

MONMOUTH OFFICE, WALES

Singleton Court Business Park
Wonastow Road
Monmouth
Monmouthshire NP25 5JA
Tel: 01600 714611
Fax: 01600 716744

chris.formaggia@enzygo.com

Please visit our website for more information.

enzygo.com