

## Jenkinson , Joe

---

**From:** Jenkinson , Joe  
**Sent:** 03 July 2012 14:48  
**To:** 'howard.baxter@sheffield.gov.uk'  
**Cc:** Azam , Mahmood; Moralee , Stephen; Cliffe , Tim; Ellis , Robert  
**Subject:** 12/01017/FUL - Land and Buildings at Meadowhall Way

Mr Baxter,

I refer to your letter, dated 12th April 2012, regarding the above application. You will note that on 24th April 2012 Barnsley MBC responded by indicating that we had no comments to make regarding the proposal. However, as discussed last week, we have since given further consideration to the proposal, in particular the Next Home & Garden element of the scheme. We would therefore like the following comments to be taken into consideration when you formulate your recommendation:

### Sequential Approach (SA)

The SA must consider sites within the catchment of the proposal. The applicants have defined the catchment as the whole of Sheffield and the majority of Rotherham Borough but have not included any parts of Barnsley borough. As a result, a range of sites have been considered in Sheffield and Rotherham but none have been looked at in Barnsley.

Meadowhall itself is a regional out of centre shopping location and it clearly attracts large quantities of Barnsley residents. No consideration has been given in the application as to if the catchment should extend into Barnsley and include the town centre. This proposal has the potential to make the Meadowhall area an even more attractive shopping destination for Barnsley residents drawing trade away from Barnsley centres, particularly the town centre.

As a result, the catchment of the bulky goods unit should extend to Barnsley town centre and should consider the edge of centre sites that are present there (examples include the former YEDL site off Harborough Hill Road, which currently enjoys a retail planning permission for 7,060m<sup>2</sup> gross floorspace and land at Heelis Street). Additionally it should be noted that there is little justification in planning policy for allowing a retail use to disregard the proper application of the sequential approach simply because the operator feels that an in or edge of centre site does not suit their business model. This seems to be the case with this application with the sequential approach not being carried out according to policy and guidance. As a result the application should be refused.

### Impact Assessment

National policy requires that edge or out of centre retail proposals are assessed in terms of their impact on both in centre investment within the catchment of the proposal and the impact on town centre vitality and viability. Because the statements accompanying the application do not recognise Barnsley as being within the catchment of this proposal no assessment of potential impacts on Barnsley has been carried out. In particular, the potential impact of this scheme on the Barnsley Marketplace in-centre shopping centre has not been evaluated. Additionally, no wider examination of the potential impact on the vitality and viability of the town centre, including in-centre trade and turnover has occurred. This again justifies refusal of the application.

It is also possible that further retail provision in and around Meadowhall would add to the areas attractiveness, both for consumers and retailers, to the detriment of nearby centres. If this application is granted it could encourage further inappropriate out-of-centre development in this location and the cumulative impact could be very damaging to Barnsley's centres, in particular the town centre and the planned Barnsley Markets Project.

On the basis of the comments above, Barnsley MBC objects to the application.

Regards

Joe Jenkinson  
Group Leader (Inner Area)  
Development Management  
Planning & Regulatory Services  
Barnsley Metropolitan Borough Council  
Westgate Plaza  
PO Box 604  
Barnsley  
S70 9FE

Tel: 01226 772588  
[joejenkinson@barnsley.gov.uk](mailto:joejenkinson@barnsley.gov.uk)

---

**From:** Ellis , Robert  
**Sent:** 02 July 2012 13:08  
**To:** Jenkinson , Joe  
**Cc:** Azam , Mahmood; Tweed , Paula  
**Subject:** FW: Meadowhall



Hi Joe,

I'm commenting on the application purely from a Barnsley perspective in terms of retail planning policy implications that relate to the Next Home and Garden elements of this scheme. I presume we will have no objection to the car showroom or the drive through coffee shop. As you know there are two main elements to the assessment of retail proposals, the sequential approach and an assessment of impact. I deal with both separately below.

Mahmood has asked that you let us see your final response before it is sent to Sheffield Officers.

Please let me know if you need anything else.

Regards,

Rob