2023/0531

Mr Mark Popovic

26 Strafford Avenue, Elsecar, Barnsley, S74 8AD

Double storey rear extension with a flat roof

Site Description

The dwelling is a two-storey, red-brick and render, semi-detached dwelling located in the Elsecar Conservation Area. Strafford Avenue has a consistent residential street scene featuring similar styled semi-detached and terraced properties. The dwelling is designed with an asymmetrical roof, with a small rear dormer style projection to the rear elevation, which forms part of the rear elevation of the original dwelling. A footpath runs along the side boundary of the property, linking Strafford Avenue with Lifford Place. The dwelling has planning permission for a two-storey rear extension.

Planning History

2022/0256 - Erection of two storey rear extension to dwelling (Approved with Conditions)

Proposed Development



The applicant is seeking approval for the erection of a two-storey rear extension. The extension will project 5.7 meters from the rear elevation of the dwelling. The extension has a width of 6.1 meters. The extension will feature a flat roof with a total height of 5.5 meters and an eaves height of 5.3 meters. The materials used will be matching brickwork and render.

Policy Context

Planning decisions should be made in accordance with the development plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise and the NPPF does not change the statutory status of the development plan as the starting point for decision making. The Local Plan was adopted in January 2019 and is also now accompanied by seven masterplan frameworks which apply to the largest site allocations (housing, employment and mixed-use sites). In addition, the Council has adopted a series of Supplementary Planning Documents and Neighbourhood Plans which provide supporting guidance and specific local policies and are a material consideration in the decision-making process.

The Local Plan review was approved at the full Council meeting on 24th November 2022. The review determined that the Local Plan remains fit for purpose and is adequately delivering its objectives. This means no updates to the Local Plan, in whole or in part, are to be carried out ahead of a further review. The next review is due to take place in 2027 or earlier if circumstances, require it.

Local Plan Allocation – Urban Fabric / Elsecar Conservation Area

To the extent that development plan policies are material to an application for planning permission the decision on the application must be taken in accordance with the development plan unless there are material considerations that indicate otherwise (section 70(2) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 and section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004).

In reference to this application, the following policies are relevant:

Policy SD1: Presumption in favour of Sustainable Development – States that proposals for development will be approved where there will be no significant adverse effect on the living conditions and residential amenity of existing and future residents. Development will be expected to be compatible with neighbouring land and will not significantly prejudice the current or future use of neighbouring land. Policy GD1 below will be applied to all development.

Policy GD1: General Development – Development will be approved if there will be no significant adverse effect on the living conditions and residential amenity of existing and future residents. Development will be expected to be compatible with neighbouring land and will not significantly prejudice the current or future use of neighbouring land.

Policy D1: High quality design and place making – Development is expected to be of a highquality design and will be expected to respect, take advantage of and reinforce the distinctive, local character and other features of Barnsley.

Policy HE1: The Historic Environment – Positively encourage developments that help in the management, conservation and understanding of the historic environment.

Supplementary Planning Document: House extensions and Other Domestic Alterations

This document establishes the design principles that specifically apply to the consideration of planning applications for house extensions, roof alterations, outbuildings & other domestic alterations. The general principles are that proposals should;

- Be of a scale and design which harmonises with the existing building;
- Not adversely affect the amenity of neighbouring properties;
- Maintain the character of the street scene; and
- Not interfere with highway safety

The above principles are to reflect the revised principles in the NPPF, which promote high quality design and a good standard of amenity for all existing and future occupants of land and buildings.

National Planning Policy Framework

The NPPF sets out the Government's planning policies and how these are expected to be applied. The core of this is a presumption in favour of sustainable development. Proposals that align with the Local Plan should be approved unless material considerations indicate otherwise. In respect of this application, relevant policies include:

Section 12: Achieving well designed places - The Government attaches great importance to the design of the built environment. Good design is a key aspect of sustainable development, creates better places in which to live and work and helps make development acceptable to communities. It is important to plan positively for the inclusion of high-quality design for all developments, including individual buildings, public and private spaces and wider area development schemes.

Within section 12, paragraph 134 states that "development that is not well designed should be refused, especially where it fails to reflect local design policies and government guidance on design, taking into account any local design guidance and supplementary planning documents such as design guides and codes".

Consultations

The LPA's Conservation Officer was consulted and objected to the application.

Representations

Neighbour notification letters were sent to surrounding properties, no comments were received.

Assessment

Principle of Development

The site falls within urban fabric which has no specific land allocation; however, the site and surrounding area is made up principally of housing. Extensions to residential properties are considered acceptable where they do not have a detrimental impact on the amenity of surrounding residents, visual amenity, highway safety and in this case also the Elsecar Conservation Area.

It is noted that a similar scheme already has planning permission (2022/0256) but with a hipped roof option. Therefore, this assessment will only focus on the difference between the two applications being the change in roof type from a hipped roof to a flat roof.

Visual Amenity and Impact upon the Elsecar Conservation Area

The main issue in terms of visual amenity is the change in roof type to a flat roof from a hipped roof as originally approved (2022/0256). It's important to note that in the time between the two applications this property, along with the south end of Strafford Avenue and Lifford Place were recently brought into the Elsecar Conservation Area. Therefore, the impact upon visual amenity now includes the impact upon the Conservation Area. The new appraisal details the historic significance of the streets and why it was justified to bring these streets into the designated area.

In summary the special interest relates to these streets being the final elements of the planned garden village under the paternalism of the Fitzwilliam's. Although of a distinctly different style to the bulk of the rest of the Conservation Area, these properties have a recognisable group value, retain many original features and overall, clearly contribute positively to the Conservation Area.

The bulk of the ground floor of the extension has been constructed in accordance with the previously approved plans and the upper floor is well under way in blockwork. In terms of the overall acceptability of this design featuring the flat roof and whether it conserves or enhances the character of the Elsecar Conservation Area it should be noted that there is some loss of original features to

the rear including the original cat slide roof. The approved scheme (2022/0256) which includes the same extension but with a hipped roof is more appropriate for the Conservation Area setting.

The SPD states that "extensions which radically alter the shape of a house are not acceptable" and "the flat roof is an ugly and inferior form of construction". The flat roof as proposed is at odds with the pitched roof on the original dwelling and although the dwelling features an original flat roof offshoot extending this to a projection of 5.7 meters is deemed unacceptable. The change in roof type decrease the harmony between the original dwelling and the extension and the extension appears less subordinate because of this.

Additionally, the flat roof would be highly prominent in the street scenes of both Stafford Avenue and Lifford Place to which the rear elevation of the dwelling is visible to. Although other flat roof rear extensions can be seen on Strafford Avenue they are not built with the same large projection as proposed which further exacerbates the impact and they were built before the area became an established part of the Elsecar Conservation Area.

The new proposal for a flat roof on what is already a large extension in terms of projection and one that is highly visible from public ream is therefore considered harmful to the character of the Conservation Area and unacceptable in terms of its impact upon the visual amenity of Strafford Avenue and Lifford Place.

Residential Amenity

In regard to residential amenity there has been no change in the impact on this between the two applications. The change in roof type does not affect the amenity of surrounding residents or the amenity of the host dwelling.

Highway Safety

There will be no impact upon highway safety.

Recommendation

Refuse