Planning Potential

Dearne Estates

Planning and Retail Statement (including Statement of Community Involvement)

Barnsley Road, Goldthorpe



Contents

1. Introduction	1
2. Site Description and Planning History	3
3. Community Involvement	6
4. Proposed Development	9
5. Sequential Approach	12
6. Retail Assessment	17
7. Planning Assessment	26
8. Conclusion	31

Appendices

1. Site Locations
2. Demographics
3. Community Letter
4. Sequential Pro-formas
5. Home Bargains Pro-formas
6. Catchment Plan
7. Health Checks
8. Case Studies

Planning Potential Ltd

London
Magdalen House
148 Tooley Street
London SE1 2TU
T: 020 7357 8000

Harrogate
14-15 Regent Parade
Harrogate HG1 5AW
T: 01423 502115

Bristol
13-14 Orchard Street
Bristol BS1 5EH
T: 0117 905 5346

Report Author: Charlotte Boyes
charlotte@planningpotential.co.uk

Report Reference:
15/2431

1. Introduction

1.1. This Planning and Retail Statement has been prepared on behalf of 'Dearne Estates Ltd' in support of two full planning applications at Land North of Barnsley Road, Highgate, Goldthorpe. The development as a whole is for the erection of two retail units, with car parking, landscaping and associate works. However for legal purposes, individual applications for each retail unit have been submitted via Planning Portal under references PP-04774880 and PP-04774893 on Friday 22nd January 2016. Site location plans are attached in **Appendix 1**.

1.2. The whole site is 0.83 hectares in size and comprises an identified development site on the western edge of Goldthorpe. Goldthorpe is a principle town within Barnsley Council's settlement hierarchy, where growth and investment are to be directed to. The site itself comprises a prominent gateway location, which has historically benefited from planning permission for mixed-use and residential development, thus establishing the principle of development on the site.

1.3. In November 2014 a hybrid application was submitted for the wider regeneration of the site. Full planning permission was granted on the western portion of the site for an Aldi store and outline planning permission was granted on the eastern side (closest to the existing settlement) for residential development. Subsequently, the Aldi store has been built, leaving a gap between the new development and the urban area. A present the remainder of the site (the land subject to this planning application) is surrounded by a close boarded fence.

1.4. The allocation of the site and previous consent are for commercial uses and on this basis there should be no objection in principle to a more viable alternative to residential development. These proposals represent a realistic viable opportunity to complete the development of the wider site and to complement the adjoining Aldi foodstore which commenced trading on 5th November 2015.

1.5. At present the site is under-utilised in terms of built development, and lies between the Aldi store and the built form of Goldthorpe. Therefore the site offers an ideal opportunity for a mixed-use development that will form a logical link between the Aldi site and the urban fabric of Goldthorpe.

1.6. The site provides a viable and immediately deliverable investment opportunity for Goldthorpe. The decline of the coal mining industry has had a significant impact on the area resulting in high levels of unemployment in the area. The 2011 census statistics for the Dearne South Ward, highlights that 5.2% of the residents are unemployed compared to an average for England of 4.4%.

1.7. The redevelopment of the site will complete the redevelopment of this parcel of land and undoubtedly have tangible and long term positive impacts on the local area. Due to the prominent location of the site, it is likely that the development will also act as a catalyst for further investment into the area.

1.8. A pre-application meeting was held with Barnsley Metropolitan Borough Council's Officers on 2nd April 2015 in advance of the planning application submission. During this meeting the principle of the development was discussed, along with planning history, planning policy, design, layout and highways issues. Formal pre-application advice was received on 8th June 2015. A meeting has also been held with Ward Councillors on 28th May 2015.

1.9. The revised scheme will also be publicised through a community update letter following the submission of this application which will detail the proposed development.

1.10. This statement has been prepared to outline the proposed development and community engagement exercises conducted by the Applicant. In addition this statement will demonstrate how the proposals accord with the latest national and local planning policy framework, including sequential and retail impact considerations. It will demonstrate how the wider benefits of the development on an identified development site outweigh any perceived adverse impacts.

2. Site Description and Planning History

Highgate, Goldthorpe

2.1. The whole site is located within Highgate, a suburb to the west of Goldthorpe, which historically was a village with its own services and shopping provision. Overtime this settlement has merged with Goldthorpe and now shares its services. This statement will refer to the location of the site as Goldthorpe, as this is consistent with the local planning policies of Barnsley Metropolitan Borough Council.

2.2. Goldthorpe is identified as a 'Principal Town' as part of the Dearne Towns which is comprised of Goldthorpe, Thurnscoe and Bolton on Dearne. The application sites are located approximately 8.8 miles east of Barnsley town centre and is positioned between the M1 and A1 with Doncaster to the east. Goldthorpe's strategic location in respect to the national road network has allowed the town to become a major logistics hub.

2.3. The adopted Core Strategy identifies the priority for the Dearne Towns as housing and employment development with a particular emphasis on renewing areas where the market has failed through the HMR Pathfinder initiative.

2.4. Goldthorpe town centre is the main shopping and service centre for the Dearne Towns and benefits from the Goldthorpe Renaissance Market Town Initiative.

2.5. The decline of the coal mining industry had a significant impact on the area resulting in high levels of unemployment and large amounts of despoiled and derelict land. On this point, the 2011 census statistics for the Dearne South Ward in which the application sites lie, highlight that **5.2%** of the residents are unemployed compared to an average for England of 4.4%. Also the number of households with no access to a car or van is also above the national average of 25.8%, at **27.8%.** Further to this, the average income within the Dearne South Ward is also lower than the average income for Yorkshire at **£410** a week compared to £520 across the region. In respect of social grade, the Dearne South ward is dominated by social grade C1, C2, D and E. Demographics are attached in **Appendix 2**.

The Application Sites and Surrounding Area

2.6. The application sites occupies a prominent location on the A635 Dearne Valley Parkway at the junction with Barnsley Road immediately to the west of Highgate, Goldthorpe within the identified settlement boundaries of the settlement.

2.7. The development site is approximately 0.83 ha in size, and is irregular in shape and slopes from the north east of the site down towards the proposed access to the south west of the site. A number of mature trees and hedges clearly define the application sites to the north, east and south.

2.8. In respect of the wider road network, the site is bounded to the north by the Dearne Valley Parkway (A635), beyond which is agricultural land which is allocated 'green belt' land. Directly to the west of the site, beyond the Aldi store is the Dearne Valley Parkway (A635)/Barnsley Road junction, which is a primary gateway in to Goldthorpe from the west. Located to the east of the site is the Mulberry Close residential estate, which consists of large and well-designed family homes. Beyond this residential estate is the Goldthorpe train station and the town centre

of Goldthorpe. To the south of the application sites is agricultural land beyond which is a large industrial park (off Commercial Road), which includes the new Aldi Distribution Park.

Image 1: View across site from south western corner



Source: Planning Potential Site Visit

Image 2: View across site from South Eastern Corner



Source: Planning Potential Site Visit

2.9. Historically the application sites has been allocated for development with planning permission historically granted on the site for mixed use development including a hotel and restaurant.

2.10. At present, given the site's context between the Aldi foodstore and the existing residential dwellings to the east, the site is a void, under-utilised parcel of land that does not conform to the surrounding context of the site or the urban fabric of Highgate. This is illustrated in the photos above. This proposal presents a viable opportunity to complete the previously consented urban extension of Highgate, and develop the infill site created by the construction of the Aldi foodstore to the west.

2.11. The site offers an ideal opportunity for a retail development that will create an additional retail destination along the recently opened Aldi foodstore that in turn will create a number of spin-off benefits for the residents and existing traders of Goldthorpe.

2.12. The single vehicular access point off Barnsley Road to the south of the site will be shared with the Aldi foodstore, but once on site a separate turning will provide direct vehicle access to the proposed retail units. The shared vehicle access off Barnsley Road is already constructed and links the site on to Barnsley Road and onwards to Goldthorpe district centre via a direct link which is subject to a 30mph speed limit.

2.13. In terms of public transport, there are a number of bus stops located along Barnsley Road. These include bus services X19, 203, 213, 216, 217/218, 219 and 226 which all provide a regular service through the centre of Goldthorpe and on to the surrounding settlements of Wath upon Dearne, Bolton upon Dearne, Conisbrough, Grimethorpe, Wombell, Thurnscoe, Barnsley, Doncaster, Rotherham and Robin Hood Airport.

2.14. Pedestrian access to the site can be achieved from Barnsley Road. It is noted that existing footpaths are wide, well-lit, clean and overlooked by neighbouring residential properties. The footpaths facilitate clear, safe and direct pedestrian linkages to Goldthorpe district centre and the wider residential areas which are a 10 minute walk (based on Google Maps).

2.15. The site does not lie within a Conservation Area, and no Listed Buildings or TPO trees will be affected by the development proposal.

Planning History

2.16. The planning history of the wider site provides an important context to the planning application.

2.17. There are six major planning applications of particular relevance to this application. The first application (application reference 98/1185/DE) was for an outline permission for 'Erection of hotel/ bar/restaurant and two roadside restaurants' and approved subject to conditions. The application was renewed under planning permissions 2004/0320, 2007/0004 and 2010/0107.

2.18. The reserved matters application was approved on the 4th July 2012 (application reference 2012/0304). An extension to time limit for the implementation of applications 2010/0107 and 2012/0304 was approved on the 24th May 2013, under planning permission 2013/0182, subject to conditions.

2.19. As referred to above, the sixth major planning application (application reference 2014/1020) of relevance was a hybrid application approved in November 2014 for the 'Erection of a foodstore with car parking, landscaping and associated works (Full) and erection of residential development (Outline)'. The outline element of the hybrid application for the erection of the residential development comprises the application sites.

2.20. The planning history of the site demonstrates that the Council are keen to encourage investment in the site.

3. Community Involvement

Consultation conducted as part of RB2014/0230

Pre-submission Consultation

3.1. This Statement should be read in conjunction with the Statement of Community Involvement submitted as part of application reference RB2014/1020, as its conclusions are not repeated within this document.

3.2. In summary, as part of the original application, a newsletter detailing the proposals with response card was posted to 1,500 addresses as well as the Ward and Parish Councillors prior to a public consultation event. The postage paid feedback card allowed local residents to say whether they supported the proposals and to provide comments.

3.3. A community consultation event was held on 21st July 2014 between 3.00pm and 7.00pm. The exhibition was held at the Highgate Working Mens Club, Barnsley Road, Goldthorpe and 40 people attended. Details of the responses were provided in the previous Statement of Community Involvement submitted.

3.4. A total of 113 responses were received, with an overwhelming **96%** of responses supporting the application.

3.5. Prior to the submission of the original application, a pre-application meeting was held on 18th December 2013. This was attended by Barnsley Metropolitan Borough Council's senior planners and policy officers and members of the Dearne Estates and Aldi design team. Background to the proposals was discussed, as well as planning policy, highways and design considerations.

3.6. Initial briefings were held with local stakeholders to understand the views of local representatives. A meeting was held with the Councillor for the Dearne South Ward on the 14th July 2014. The key issues of discussion related to highways, in particular traffic congestion. Other issues in respect of design, amenity and the planning case were also discussed.

Post-Submission Consultation

Resident Consultation

3.7. The application was publicised by site notices which were posted adjacent to the site on Barnsley Road. Individual letters of notification from the Council were also sent to adjacent properties.

3.8. There was substantial support for the previous hybrid application with 108 of the 113 letters received in support of the development. Reasons for supporting the application included:

- Increase jobs a plus for the locality;
- More local competition/ choice;
- Easy access;
- Enhance look the site;
- Already Aldi shoppers and won't have to travel as far;

- Don't have to travel far;
- Clean looking and modern building welcomed; and
- New shop will boost existing shops already in Goldthorpe.

3.9. Four letters of objection were received and the reasons for the objections included:

- Impact on local house prices;
- Increase of traffic and congestion;
- Loss of green space; and
- Impact on local businesses.

Third Party Comments

3.10. A letter of representation was also received from ASDA who objected to the proposal for a number of reasons including sequential, retail matters and the Council's lack of a 5 year housing supply. However, in the determination of the application the Officer considered that the proposals would have limited impact on the vitality and viability of Goldthorpe district centre and vacant school site was not sequentially preferable due to the availability of the site.

Statutory Responses

3.11. The Case Officer for planning permission 2014/1020 collated comments from a number of statutory bodies as part of the consultation process, all of which were supportive. A summary of their comments are provided below:

- **Affordable Housing-** It was outlined that the affordable housing requirement was for 15% of the proposed units and that a mix of up to 20% intermediate housing and 80% social rented will be acceptable.
- **Biodiversity Officer-** No objections subject to conditions;
- **Design-** No objections;
- **Education-** No objections;
- **Environment Agency-** No objections, subject to conditions;
- **Highways-** Support subject to conditions;
- **Highways Drainage-** No objections subject to conditions;
- **Planning Policy-** No objections;
- **Pollution Control-** No objections, subject to conditions to deal with noise generated by the operation of the proposed food store and traffic noise from the A635 on the residential element of the proposal;
- **South Yorkshire Passenger Transport Executive (SYPTE)-** No objections, but sought two new bus stops that are to be included in the section 278 agreement;

- **SYMAS/ Coal Authority-** No objection, subject to conditions;
- **Trees-** No objections; and
- **Yorkshire Water-** No objection, subject to conditions.

3.12. Overall, the proposal was welcomed by the Local Planning Authority and Members with planning permission approved on 18th November 2014 at Planning Board.

3.13. Members and Officers agreed the principle of retail development and the modest size of the proposed foodstore was acceptable given that it would not have a significant adverse impact on the vitality and viability of the Goldthorpe District Centre. Planning Committee also considered that the sequential test had being passed. The outline housing element of the scheme was also considered acceptable, based on the sustainable location of the site within a Principal Town earmarked to accommodate significant housing growth. Overall the scheme was considered to be in accordance with relevant Core Strategy Policies and the NPPF and NPPG.

Consultation conducted as part of this revised Application

3.14. In light of changes, Planning Potential on behalf of Dearne Estates will write to all adjoining residents; informing of them of changes made, with contact details should they require any further information. A draft copy of the letter is attached to **Appendix 3** of this Statement.

Ward Councillor Meeting 28th May 2015

3.15. Prior to submission the Applicant and Consultant Team have engaged with Ward Councillors regularly and met with Councillors to discuss the revised proposals on 28th May 2015. The ward Councillor are encouraging of the redevelopment of the site and are supportive of a proposal that will bring jobs and investment into the local area.

Pre-application Meeting 18th March 2015

3.16. A pre-application meeting was held on 18th March 2015 in regards to the proposed development. This was attended by a Barnsley Council Planning Officer along with the Applicant and Planning Consultant. Background to the proposals was discussed, as well as planning policy, retail case, highways and design considerations. A formal response was received from Barnsley Council on 8th June 2015.

Post Application Consultation

3.17. Given the interest displayed by residents in the approved development (reference 2014/1020) Planning Potential will seek to ensure that information continually flows through existing channels to interested parties.

3.18. When the application has been submitted, the Ward Councillors will be informed and a copy of this Statement will be sent by email for information purposes.

3.19. The project's dedicated freephone information line number and email address will again be available throughout the course of the planning process for those that require further information or to discuss the proposals in more detail.

4. Proposed Development

Quantum and Nature of the Proposals

4.1. The application proposes the construction of two retail units. Unit1 will be occupied by 'Home Bargains' (Use Class A1) and at present unit 2 does not have a confirmed operator (Use Class A1, A2, A3, A4 and A5).

4.2. In terms of format, the proposed Home Bargains will have a gross floorspace of 1,394sqm; 732 sqm of the floorspace area will be for the sale of comparison goods and 244sqm of the floorspace will be for the sale of ancillary convenience goods. The second retail unit will have a gross floorspace of 232sqm, and a net sales area of approximately 162 sqm. The breakdown of floorspace for both units is provided in the table below:

Table 4.1 Summary of Floorspace Proposed

	Gross Internal Area (sqm)	Net Sales Area (sqm)	Comparison Floorspace (sqm)	Convenience Floorspace (sqm)
Unit 1- Home Bargains	1,394	976	732	244
Unit 2- Unnamed	232	162	162	0
TOTAL	**1,626**	**1,138**	**894**	**244**

Source: Based on Drawing Reference 1187-009

4.3. Home Bargain's property portfolio includes stores which are typically between 1,111 sqm and 2,787 sqm. It is within this range the retailer demonstrates its scope for flexibility. This proposal is for a Home Bargains store with a trading floorspace of 976 sqm and a 75/25 split between comparison and convenience floorspace is typical of a Home Bargains shop format.

4.4. Likewise the trading floorspace of the second retail unit at 162 sqm and is being marketed to a range of potential occupants falling within use classes A1, A2, A3, A4 and A5. For robustness we have assessed this floorspace as comparison floorspace for the purpose of the following capacity assessment.

Site Layout and Design

4.5. The layout and design of the two buildings have been subject to detailed discussions with Barnsley Council and have evolved over time as outlined in section 3 of this Statement. The site's layout is also informed by the layout of the adjoining Aldi foodstore. Comments from the Council have been taken on board and will be discussed at further length in the Design and Access Statement.

4.6. The portion of undeveloped land in the north east corner of the site cannot be built on due to a covenant on the site, therefore the proposals have had to work around this.

4.7. The Home Bargains has been positioned on the western edge of the site and the smaller retail unit has been positioned in the south eastern corner of the site, with the entrances to both stores facing towards the proposed car park. Car parking will be provided on site, directly in front of both the A1 retail stores. The layout of

the development reflects the physical characteristics of the site and effectively utilises the space available, without compromising the quality of the overall design and residential amenity of adjoining properties. The position and access to the two retail units will enable natural surveillance of the car park from both retail units.

Amenity

4.8. To meet operator requirements for opening and servicing the retail units, we apply for the following hours. These hours are in line with the neighbouring Aldi foodstore and are supported by the attached Noise Report–

Opening Hours-

- Monday to Saturday (including Public Holidays): 8am – 10pm
- Sundays: any 6 hours in line with current trading restrictions, between 10am to 5pm

Delivery Hours-

- Monday to Saturday (including Public Holidays): 7am – 11pm
- Sundays: 8am – 6pm

4.9. Importantly, stores are not 24 hour and deliveries can be scheduled to arrive just before or after opening hours to avoid conflict with customers.

4.10. The delivery yard for Unit 1 is comprised of a 25 metre turning area and will be located on the North West corner of the site, immediately adjoining the stores footprint. The service yards location allows simple, safe and efficient servicing arrangements allowing HGV's to arrive, unload and leave the site without any disruption, conflict with the wider highway network or any negative impact on residential amenity. The service yard is located to the north west of the site therefore there is a significant distance between the servicing area and the nearest residential properties. In addition the area of undevelopable land in the north east corner of the site insures minimal impact on the existing residential development to the east of the application sites. The smaller retail unit will be serviced by smaller delivery vehicles via the main entrance to the store.

4.11. It is anticipated that the stores will receive approximately 1 delivery every 2 days on average via HGV.

4.12. Lighting on the site will be carefully controlled to ensure no light spillage to neighbouring properties. Lights in the car park will be turned off at night with low level lighting remaining in the store for security purposes. This reflects procedures adopted by Aldi on the adjoining site.

Accessibility

4.13. Vehicular access to the two retail units will be via the new access from Barnsley Road built as part of the operating Aldi foodstore adjoining the application sites. Once off Barnsley Road, the two retail units will be accessed from the shared access with the Aldi foodstore, utilising a separate internal access point that will provide direct access to the car park.

4.14. A total of 113 car parking spaces will be provided for the two retail units and will be located immediately in-front of the two stores. This will include 8 disabled spaces, 4 parent / toddler spaces, 5 staff spaces. Further to this 5 cycle hoops along to Home Bargains store frontage.

4.15. The site layout also seeks to maximise existing pedestrian linkages, to ensure the car park area is easily navigable on foot. Consequently, the application proposes a number of pedestrian crossings within the site which will facilitate customer movement between the two retail stores and adjoining car parking area, the consented Aldi store to the west and onto Barnsley Road to the south.

Landscaping

4.16. As part of the application proposal, a number of landscape improvements are proposed, including substantial hard and soft landscaping around and across the site to minimise the visual impact of the proposals on the wider area. In addition, planting along the boundaries of the site will seek to soften the edge of the site from the highway(s) to the north and south and the existing neighbouring properties located to the east. A cluster of specimen trees (landscape bund) are also proposed providing a feature landscape buffer, restricting views into the site from the existing residential properties to the east.

4.17. It is also proposed that a landscaping strategy will be implemented within and surrounding the car parking area both to denote the parking layout and to break-up the visual impact of the hard-standing.

4.18. Further details on design and layout will be provided within the accompanying Design and Access statement produced by the Harris Partnership.

Employment

4.19. The proposal represents a significant investment opportunity for Goldthorpe, including the creation of jobs on a site identified for the two proposed retail developments. Indeed, the proposed retail units will create up to approximately 60 full and part time jobs. It is also anticipated that up to 200+ job opportunities will be created at the construction phase for the two retail stores alone. On this note, Dearne Estates are prepared to enter into a Local Labour Agreement or suitably worded conditions to ensure that this is implemented.

5. Sequential Approach

5.1. The wider site has already been accepted as a sequentially preferable location in terms of the decision making process for the Aldi store. It was accepted that this proposal could not be suitably and viably located on any of the other sites identified. The reasoning for the new proposals has not changed. There are high levels of expenditure leakage within the catchment area that can be clawed back through these proposals. This will not necessarily prevent the other sites coming forward over time. The synergy between the Aldi store and the Home Bargains is essential for the success of this proposal and the jobs and investment that this will bring. The justification for these proposals is outlined in the section below and attached appendix.

5.2. In accordance with the NPPF, PPG, local policy CS31 'Town Centres' and 'saved' UDP policy S3, a proportionate retail and sequential assessment is submitted alongside this application based on a 5 minute drive time catchment in line with the Council's pre-application advice.

5.3. At the heart of the NPPF is the presumption of sustainable economic development. There can be no doubt that securing economic growth is a still a major priority for central Government and therefore development that secures this must be determined in the presumption of favourability.

5.4. Historically the site has been allocated for 'Hotel/Motel Development' under 'saved' UDP policy DE6. However the Officer's Report for planning permission 2014/1020 and the pre-application advice received confirms that this allocation is out of date following the length of time the site has been allocated and the fact that no such use has been developed on the site, despite the site's planning history. Therefore other uses can now be considered if they accord with relevant local and national planning policies. We note that within the emerging Local Plan the entire site, including the Aldi site to the west is identified for 'new housing', under site reference H23 'Land west of Holly Grove'. However as this document has not been independently examined and adopted yet this document holds limited weight.

5.5. Since the adoption of the UDP and the Core Strategy, the Goldthorpe Masterplan was adopted in 2012. The objectives of the Masterplan include improving public realm, new retail development, a public square, car park reorganisation and shop front refurbishment. As part of this work an economic study identified that Goldthorpe town centre has the potential to support additional retail floorspace. The Masterplan allocates the existing primary school site at Barnsley Road to accommodate a new anchor foodstore/retail store. At the present moment in time, the Masterplan site is acknowledged to be available and suitable for the proposals. However the site is not a commercially viable development for the intended retailer. This has been considered in greater detail within the sequential pro-formas which form **appendix 4** of this statement.

5.6. Notwithstanding the clear policy and retail justification, the demographics for the Dearne South ward demonstrates the need for affordable and accessible retail provision for local residents. The importance of jobs is recognised in the Council's 'Growing Barnsley's Economy' strategy document which highlights the importance of jobs and raising the skill base of the district.

5.7. The application proposal represents a significant investment and commitment by Dearne Estates in to the local economy. This considerable investment would undoubtedly have a tangible and long term positive impact on the local area. This includes the creation of approximately 60 new full and part time jobs and substantial landscaping and streetscape benefits.

Introduction

5.8. The National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) states *'local planning authorities should apply a sequential test to planning applications for main town centre uses that are not in an existing centre and are not in accordance with an up to date Local Plan'* (paragraph 24).

5.9. The online Planning Practice Guidance (PPG) published in March 2014 supports the policies within the NPPF. Paragraph 10 of 'Ensuring the vitality of town centres' includes important guidance on town centres and the application of the sequential test, defining how the sequential test should be used in decision-taking.

5.10. The PPG goes on to outline a checklist which sets out the considerations that should be taken into account in determining whether a proposal complies with the sequential test:

- *"With due regard to the requirement to demonstrate flexibility, has the suitability of more central sites to accommodate the proposal been considered? Where the proposal would be located in an edge of centre or out of centre location, preference should be given to accessible sites that are well connected to the town centre. Any associated reasoning should be set out clearly.*
- *Is there scope for flexibility in the format and/or scale of the proposal? It is not necessary to demonstrate that a potential town centre or edge of centre site can accommodate precisely the scale and form of development being proposed, but rather to consider what contribution more central sites are able to make individually to accommodate the proposal.*
- *If there are no suitable sequentially preferable locations, the sequential test is passed."*

"Wherever possible, the local planning authority should support the applicant in undertaking the sequential test, including sharing any relevant information. The application of the test should be proportionate and appropriate for the given proposal. Where appropriate, the potential suitability of alternative sites should be discussed between the developer and local planning authority at the earliest opportunity." (Paragraph 10, PPG, March 2014)

5.11. Therefore, for a more central available site to be sequentially preferable it must be 'suitable' for the development proposal. In assessing whether a site is suitable the decision taker and Developer must consider whether there is scope for 'flexibility'. The definition of 'suitability' and the extent to which 'flexibility' should be demonstrated has been the subject of much debate. Case law and appeal precedent assists in the interpretation of these points.

5.12. The High Court Judgement 'Tesco Stores Ltd v Dundee City Council' published 21 March 2012 supports the principle that a sequential site should be suitable for the developers' proposals i.e. two retail units. In order to assess what is suitable, the developer i.e. Dearne Estates need to assess the market it needs to serve and compete successfully within it.

5.13. The High Court decision at Rushden Lakes (appeal reference: APP/G2815/V/12/2190175) confirms that when considering whether there are any sequentially preferable sites, the correct interpretation is to consider whether it can be accommodated on an actual alternative site, (paragraph 15). The Secretary of State has confirmed that the requirement for flexibility does not include a requirement for disaggregation (paragraph 16) we must therefore consider the proposals as a whole when addressing the sequential approach.

5.14. A more recent appeal case was determined by the Secretary of State in June 2015 for Sainsburys Supermarkets Ltd vs Braintree District Council, and can also be afforded significant weight. This decision provides further opinion and interpretation on the Rushden Lakes decision; the Inspector stating:

> *"Moreover, the RL (Rushden Lakes) application was for a wide variety of uses including a home and garden centre, retail units, visitor centre, restaurants, boathouse, hotel, crèche and leisure club. It was described in summary as a mixed retail and leisure scheme. The retail element was of significant size, being some 31,502m2 of retail units. If the Secretary of State had wanted to qualify his statement on disaggregation in any way, that could have been achieved very simply by the addition of words such as 'in this case'. Indeed, the variety of uses in the RL proposal and the fact that the proposal included retail units, rather than one large retail unit, would have afforded more rather than less opportunity for some disaggregation if that had been an aim."*

Home Bargains Business Model

5.15. In addition to the above, it is also important to set out the context of Home Bargains as a retailer, who are committed to occupying the larger retail unit. Given the nature of Home Bargain's business model, there are a number of points which are of paramount importance to enable the Home Bargains offer to be achieved. These are detailed within **Appendix 5** of this statement. There are a number of key principals in terms of site layout that the retailer need to adhere to ensure their business works.

5.16. From extensive research and the experience of Home Bargains, the retail model has evolved with the majority of pipeline stores having a floorspace of between 1,115sq m (circa 12,000sq ft) and 2,323sq m gross (circa 25,000sq ft) (GIA). It is important to note that whilst Home Bargains have opened a number of town centre stores in the past the company's business model has evolved as a process of their learnings within these stores.

5.17. The retailer's operational requirements can be summarised as follows:

- The ability to sell the full range of goods including both bulky and non-bulky non-food goods as well as ancillary food and drink products;
- A demised customer car park of an appropriate size directly adjacent to the retail unit to allow the safe and direct transfer of goods from store to customer vehicle;
- The provision of trolley bays within the car park (this is an explicit requirement of any new lease);

- Simple, safe and efficient servicing arrangements allowing HGV's to arrive, unload and leave the site without any disruption, conflict with the wider highway network or any negative impact on residential amenity;
- The provision of sales area on a single level with clear internal space. Multi-level store formats do not provide a viable trading position for Home Bargains, the least because of the high proportion of customers who have been shown to undertake their shop using a trolley; and
- A customer base that is able to make purchases from various ranges, for example someone buying home furnishings may also want to purchase the other related household items and so on. The core element of the retail offer is the complementary nature of many of the products and the synergy that exists between the product ranges.

Sequential Assessment

5.18. When considering the sequential approach, paragraph 17 of the PPG advises that the identified catchment of the proposed retail units should be realistic and relate well to the size and function of the proposed development. The catchment of the store is attached to **Appendix 6** of this Statement and is comprised of Thurnscoe, Goldthorpe and Bolton upon Dearne. This reflects a 5 minute drive time and reflects the catchment adopted for the neighbouring Aldi foodstore which was based on the Council's Small Centres Study (November 2010) Goldthorpe Catchment.

5.19. In order to be consistent with the recent Aldi foodstore application on the adjoining site (2014/1020), the same 3 sites have been reassessed. In addition, the former Co-op on Doncaster Road has become vacant, so has been included within this assessment.

5.20. A detailed assessment of each site is provided at **Appendix 4**, along with individual illustrations to identify the extent and location of each site. Each site has been assessed against the criteria contained within the NPPF, namely whether the site is 'suitable', 'available' and 'viable' in order to be considered a genuinely sequentially preferable location.

5.21. Table 5.1 summarises each site and indicates the grounds on which each site is discounted from the sequential assessment:

Table 5.1 Secuential Site Summary

Site Location	NPPF Location	Available	Suitable	Viable
1.Goldthorpe Primary School, High Street, Goldthorpe	In-Centre	Yes	Yes	No
2.Development Site, North of Doncaster Road, Goldthorpe	In-Centre	No	No	No
3.Station Road, Thurnscoe	In-Centre	No	No	No
4. Former Co-op, Doncaster Road, Goldthorpe	In-Centre	Yes	No	No

Source: Planning Potential Research

5.22. The above analysis demonstrates that there are no suitable sequential alternatives within the identified catchment. However, what is clear from the above is that the application sites, due to its availability for redevelopment; its suitability to serve a localised catchment; and overall accessibility, is the most appropriate sequential site within Goldthorpe to deliver the promoted retail units.