



Retail Sequential Report

Revision A (23.02.2024) At the planners request additional sites outside of the town centre and within the catchment area of the business have been considered as part of this Retail Sequential Report. Additions added in blue.

Application site: Kingdom Hall of Jehovah's Witness, 426 Carlton Road, Barnsley, S71 3HX

Proposal: 2023 1053 - change of use from place of worship to retail building at 426 Carlton Road, Carlton, Barnsley.

Introduction

Grafters Warehouse is a family run business delivering workwear in Barnsley and becoming one of the fastest growing workwear shops in Yorkshire. They also offer embroidery and print services in partnership with a local company in Monk Bretton, to tradespeople and local schools. The company started over 20 years ago, under the name P&D Workwear, out of a small shop on Cross Lane, Royston. Early retirement of the owners, [REDACTED] meant the business was passed on to the owners son, who changed the name to Grafters Warehouse and moved location to 246 Midland Road, Royston (4 years ago). The business survived the Covid19 pandemic, and due to growth, moved premises (to their current location) of 129, Midland Road, Royston. Due to further growth of the business, there is now a need for larger premises to promote the success of the business.

NPPF and Planning Practice Guidance

The National Planning Policy Framework and Barnsley Council's Local Plan policy TC1 sets out clearly the national and local plan policy on retail relates to change of use as well as new development. There is a presumption that all retail uses/development should be located in a town/district/local centre as designated in the local plan, unless a sequential assessment demonstrates that there is no sequentially preferable location in or on the edge of a designated centre.

Paragraph 87 of the NPPF states:

Local planning authorities should apply a sequential test to planning applications for main town centre uses which are neither in an existing centre nor in accordance with an up-to-date plan. Main town centre uses should be located in town centres, then in edge of centre locations; and only if suitable sites are not available (or expected to become available within a reasonable period) should out of centre sites be considered.

Paragraph 88 of the NPPF goes on to state:

When considering edge of centre and out of centre proposals, preference should be given to accessible sites which are well connected to the town centre. Applicants and local planning

authorities should demonstrate flexibility on issues such as format and scale, so that opportunities to utilise suitable town centre or edge of centre sites are fully explored.

Barnsley Council's Local Plan policy TC1 paragraph 15.3 states:

The overall approach is that new retail and town centre development should be located within existing centres. This will help to strengthen and protect their important roles and to reduce the need to travel to out of centre locations.

The NPPF states the sequential test should look for 'suitable' sites although; 'suitable' is not defined by the NPPF or guidance. However, paragraph 011 of the Planning Practice Guidance states "The applicant of the test will need to be proportionate and appropriate for the given proposal" and the applicant should demonstrate flexibility when considering suitable sites. Paragraph 013 of the NPPF also recognises that viability has a role to play when considering suitable site by a sequential test. Paragraph 0133 states "The sequential test supports the Governments 'Town Centre First' policy. However, as promoting new development on town centre locations can be more expensive and complicated than buildings elsewhere; local planning authorities need to be realistic and flexible in applying the test".

Requirements for the business

Due to expansion and the need to relocate, the requirements for the new building are as follows:

- A unit, approximately 250sqm
- Open plan layout with greater visibility of whole space
- Single storey/ground floor only due to the moving and lifting of heavy/bulky items (or a building with lift access)
- On-site car parking/immediate street parking is required because customers carry heavy/bulky items
- Financially Viable

Sequential Test

A search for sites within Barnsley town centre was undertaken on 19th December 2023. The search used a popular estate agent website (www.rightmove.co.uk). The search was restricted to retail properties within 3 miles of the Alhambra centre (S70 1SL). This was considered to be a reasonable sized area as it would catch both the town centre and edge of centre units. The search was restricted to property 'to rent' and to a size of between 250sqm and 500sqm. The search found 4 potential properties. These are listed below:

1. The Glass Works, Barnsley.
2. Barnsley Trade Park, Wombwell Lane, Barnsley
3. 11 Regent Street South, Barnsley
4. Former TBS, 17 Market Hill, Barnsley

Out of town premises within a 3 mile radius of the catchment area of Grafter Warehouse current location in Royston has been undertaken, and a further 3 potential properties were identified (again using a popular estate agent website (www.rightmove.co.uk)). These are listed below:

1. Former Betfred, 19-21 Laithes Lane, Athersley, Barnsley, South Yorkshire, S71 3AA
2. Units 9 - 10, Laithes Lane Shopping Centre, Laithes Lane, Athersley, Barnsley, S71 3AD
3. High Street, Shafton, S72

The Glass Works, Barnsley

Assessment criteria	Comments
Location	New purpose built development in the centre of Barnsley in a prime retail and leisure location.
Size	Various sizes available from 64–1,999sqm with over 80% of the units now let. Units SU11 and SU12 combined would offer 316sqm (3,400 sq ft).
Accessibility of Building	Town centre location and has a car park with lifts available to access all floors.
Parking	There are 475 spaces in The Glass Works multi-storey car park. This includes: 20 Parent and Child Bays, 28 Disabled Bays, 10 Next Click and Collect Bays and 6EV Charging Bays. There is a cost associated to park here. Some reviews have commented on the ease of using the lifts and the times they have waited due to the low number and space within them. Spiral road leading to car park might be tight for a commercial van. The car park does have a height restriction barrier. The maximum height is 210cm (6ft 11in) which might restrict some vehicles.
Deliveries	Assume there is a separate delivery entrance with access to storage area behind units.
Environmental/Sustainability	Building itself is sustainable with low energy lighting etc. Likely to be able to be adapted internally (no demolition will be required and therefore no excessive waste will be generated).
Rental costs	Rent is approximately £25 per square foot with an additional service charge is £7.41 per square foot. This would equate to £110,194 per annum (for the combined SU11 and SU12 units)
<p>Evaluation summary:</p> <p>Although The Glass Works is a sustainable building in the heart of Barnsley Town Centre and suitable for retail and leisure units, due to the nature of the business (Grafters Warehouse) customers need to be able to access the building easily and quickly and most will be visiting with large commercial vans, which the access to and from the car park might be problematic. Close proximity from the car parking to the premises is of paramount importance as most customers will likely be handling heavy/bulky items. However, the most significant factor here and why this would have to be discarded is the rental figure per annum; which is unaffordable.</p>	

Barnsley Trade Park, Wombwell Lane, Barnsley

Assessment criteria	Comments
Location	2.15 miles outside the town centre at Barnsley Trade Park near Stairfoot.
Size	465-929sqm (trade counter unit) which is significantly larger than needed. A trade counter is defined as a location where you can sell goods at a reduced price, to registered tradesmen and businesses. These are usually attached to workshops or warehouses, but allow you to diversify the use of a rented space to be commercial as well as industrial.
Accessibility of Building	Single level with trade counter and large stock room facilities.

Parking	Ample car parking within the trade park. Due to other units on the trade park, easily access for vans will be achieved and catered for.
Deliveries	Accessible delivery to the store room area at the back without compromising on customer parking.
Environmental/Sustainability	Unsuitable layout with 'trade counter'.
Rental costs	Rent unknown.
<p>Evaluation summary:</p> <p>Due to the nature of these premises being for a 'trade counter' use, this can be discounted immediately as the nature and layout of a trade counter unit is not suitable for the needs of Grafters Warehouse. The size also exceeds what realistically is needed, although it is all on one level.</p>	

11 Regent Street South, Barnsley

Assessment criteria	Comments
Location	0.18 miles from town centre. Is on a pedestrian only road with no loading between 9.30am – 4:30pm.
Size	78–366sqm in total over 2 floors with separate units. Two ground floor retail/office units and two first floor office/studios. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Unit 1 GF 63.14sqm • Unit 2 GF 60.13sqm • Unit 3 FF 65.82sqm • Unit 4 FF 66.94sqm
Accessibility of Building	The building has 4 units in total over 2 floors. There is a staircase but no lift.
Parking	Close to Transport Interchange, although most customers would use their own transport due to nature of business. It is also close to a public car park and there is on-street parking on a nearby street (although spaces are limited).
Deliveries	Deliveries would be problematic as it's on a pedestrian only road. Deliveries would only be allowed between midnight and 9:30am and 4:30pm to midnight.
Environmental/Sustainability	Fully refurbished premises containing various units but these all have LED lighting and energy efficient electrical heating. Due to all the units in the building being needed, there will be some demolition work required to meet the needs of the business.
Rental costs	From £7,000 - £8,500 Per Annum per unit (£28,000 – £34,000 for the whole building)
<p>Evaluation summary:</p> <p>To meet the needs of the business and size, the whole building and all 4 units would be needed. The needs of the business are for it to be on one level due to the heavy/bulky items which need to be carried and stairs pose a hazard. These premises are on a pedestrian only road which would limit when deliveries could take place. Although there is a car park within walking distance (0.2 miles), if customers have large bulky and heavy items to carry this might pose a health and safety hazard. The rental costs are however affordable, but having the space split over 2 levels is not ideal, especially without a lift. The landlord might grant permission for the installation of a lift but this will be expensive and therefore push the cost viability over.</p>	

Former TBS, 17 Market Hill, Barnsley

Assessment criteria	Comments
Location	The premises occupy a prominent position within Barnsley Town Centre close to the prime pitch of Queen Street and Cheapside. Occupiers nearby include Virgin Money, Paddy Power, Natwest, Halifax and Greggs.
Size	321sqm in total over various floors. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Basement 73.48sqm • Ground Floor 121.7sqm • First Floor 82.59sqm • Second Floor 43.29sqm
Accessibility of Building	Former banking premises with accommodation arranged on basement, ground and two upper floors. The ground floor comprises of the former banking hall with the upper floors providing a combination of open plan and private office and staff facilities. There is a lift within the premises but no accessible access at the front due to a few steps to the main entrance.
Parking	The closest car park is 0.2 miles away, but there is a small amount of on-street (payable) parking outside the premises.
Deliveries	Deliveries would be from the front of the property which could pose an issue as there is no dedicated loading bay in front of the property. There is access at the side of the public house (building next to the former bank) and unsure whether this serves access to a variety of properties.
Environmental/Sustainability	The layout and condition of the former bank building would require a full refurbishment with some structural changes to turn the building into a useable retail unit. A large amount of waste would be generated as a result. The building would need to be thermally upgraded as the current EPC shows an E rating.
Rental costs	From £6,240 - £15,000 Per Annum (price varies depending on which space is selected, it was not clear how the fees are divided between the spaces)
<p>Evaluation summary:</p> <p>To meet the needs of the business and size, the whole building would be needed. The needs of the business are for it to be on one level due to the heavy/bulky items which need to be carried and stairs pose a hazard. Although this building does have a lift which would be beneficial. However, due to needing the whole building the rental cost will make this option unviable. The current condition of the building and its previous use would also necessitate it to undergo a full refurbishment thought-out including some structural changes and upgrading the building to meet better thermal properties, and as such would be too costly to make this property a viable option.</p>	

Former Betfred, 19-21 Laithes Lane, Athersley, Barnsley, South Yorkshire, S71 3AA

Assessment criteria	Comments
Location	The property is located on Laithes Lane at the junction of the A61 Wakefield Road and Laithes Lane in Athersley/New Lodge approximately 2 miles north of Barnsley Town Centre. The premises comprises of a detached retail unit. There is onsite

	parking available.
Size	The property has a net internal area of 1198 sqft (111 sqm). The unit is all on one level.
Accessibility of Building	Single storey unit.
Parking	There is a small section of off-street parking available. There is no turning circle so vehicles would have to reverse out onto Laithes lane.
Deliveries	There is a small area where deliveries could be dropped off. There is no turning circle so vehicles would have to reverse out onto Laithes lane.
Environmental/Sustainability	The building is in need of renovation and modernisation. Money will ne needed to convert this into a welcoming retail unit.
Rental costs	£833 pcm
<p>Evaluation summary: Although this building does have access to off-street parking, this is to the front of the building and customers/deliveries would have to reverse out of the spaces onto Laithes lane which could pose a hazard. The unit is also smaller than required and needs renovation work to bring it up to a standard suitable for a retail unit. There is also no separate stock room facility, and as the unit is smaller than required this makes it an unviable option.</p>	

Units 9 - 10, Laithes Lane Shopping Centre, Laithes Lane, New Lodge, Barnsley, S71 3AD

Assessment criteria	Comments
Location	The Laithes Shopping Centre is located in Athersley/New Lodge at the junction of the A61 Wakefield Road and Laithes Lane approximately 2 miles north of Barnsley Town Centre.
Size	The property has a net internal area of 1654 sqft (153.66 sqm). This is all on one level and 1 large open plan shower room area. To be back there is a small office, WC and staff kitchen.
Accessibility of Building	Single storey unit.
Parking	The unit is within Laithes Shopping Centre and there is a car park for the customers. This is shared with the whole site and no designated spaces per unit are allocated.
Deliveries	Deliveries will use the car park provided. There is no separate space within the unit for a stock room.
Environmental/Sustainability	The retail space is in good condition and would need minimal remodelling, but the rear area does need refurbishing.
Rental costs	£2,125 pcm
<p>Evaluation summary: The location of this within the shopping centre unit is excellent, but the size of the retail space is a little smaller than what the business needs, but having the unit all on one level is ideal. There is also no separate stock room facility. The rental costs are affordable although higher than the proposed unit with a smaller sqm. Having access to off-site parking is an advantage, but at busy times this might be difficult as there are a lot of retail units within the shopping centre all competing for spaces.</p>	

High Street, Shafton, S72

Assessment criteria	Comments
Location	The property is situated on High Street, Shafton close to the

	junction with Pontefract Road. Set within a parade of retail properties there is a high level of residential property in the immediate vicinity as well as a mix of other commercial occupiers such as Costcutter located opposite and other local retailers. This is within 3 miles of the existing premises.
Size	The property has a net internal area of 410 sqft (38.09 sqm), which is over 2 floors.
Accessibility of Building	There are large open plan rooms at ground and first floor level with a large disabled WC accessed on the ground floor. There is a staircase to access the first floor, but no lift.
Parking	On street parking only.
Deliveries	There is an area next to the units which assume is used for deliveries as there is a secure bollard blocking access. Deliveries could also be made via on-street parking.
Environmental/Sustainability	Large windows to maximise natural light. The unit has recently been refurbished so no further works would be required.
Rental costs	£850pcm exclusive of insurance, rates, and VAT.
<p>Evaluation summary:</p> <p>Although its positioning and location is good (along with the monthly rental fee – which is more than affordable), the property is too small to accommodate the needs of the business. The unit is also over 2 floors with stair access. Ideally a lift would be needed and due to the size of the unit this would take up more space. One of the main issues with the current premises is on-street parking, and due to the number of customers (coming in various size vehicles) this has been problematic. The location of this unit is on a busy street with many other retail units so parking is going to be an issue and cause further congestion problems.</p>	

Summary and Conclusion

The sequential test search found a total of 7 properties available for rent. There are 3 town centre properties, one edge of centre property available and 3 properties within the catchment area of the current business premises. The Glass Works could be a suitable size and internal layout to accommodate the proposal. It is in the centre of Barnsley Town Centre in a new purpose built building with its own car park. With over 80% of the units taken the options left are limited. Units SU11 and SU12 combined would offer more than adequate space, however the rental and service charge would exceed an annual fee of £110,000 which is unaffordable. The Barnsley Trade Park would have been a good location and attract the right customer base, however the units are for 'trade counter' use, which would not be suitable for the needs of Grafters Warehouse. The size also exceeds what realistically is needed. 11 Regent Street South meets the required floor area, however to achieve this it is over 2 floors with access via stairs and no lift. It is important to have the unit on one level due to the heavy/bulky items which need to be carried and stairs pose a hazard (a lift would mitigate this). The location of this on a pedestrian only road with restricted delivery time would also impact on the business and likely to deter customers from coming as there is no on-street parking to quickly collect these large heavy/bulky items. The rental costs are however affordable. Finally, the former TBS building at 17 Market Hill requires significant refurbishment and structural changes to make it suitable for a retail business. The costs associated with this and the higher rental fees make this option unaffordable. The Laithes Shopping Centre would be a suitable location for Grafters Warehouse due to its catchment area of the current premises. Its location off the A61 is also ideal. The shopping centre also offers off-street parking which is an essential criteria

for the business. However, the unit currently available is smaller than what is required, although it does offer single storey accommodation which again is what the business needs. The unit is smaller than what is needed and there is no available space to include a stock room and with the rental fee being slightly higher than what has been budgeted, this makes units 9 – 10 unviable. The other two properties are far too small to meet the needs of the business.

In conclusion, the scheme passes the sequential test as no other sites are 'suitable' due to viability, layout and accessibility.

Other Circumstances

Paragraph 91 of the NPPF states "Where an application fails to satisfy the sequential test or is likely to have a significant adverse impact on one or more of the considerations of paragraph 90, it should be refused". Whilst the view is taken that the application passes the sequential test, even if it was not deemed to, the proposal is unlikely to have a significant adverse impact on the investment, vitality or viability of the town centre. This is family run business which has been successful in its current out of town local (Royston) due to its business nature and ease of customers being able to park close and collect the products they need quickly without having to access a busy town centre and negotiate parking large commercial vans. The nature of the business Grafters Warehouse offers is similar to that of ScrewFix where units are sourced with direct access to a car park due to customers needing to collect large bulky/heavy items and visiting the premises solely to collect items needed to carry out their jobs. Therefore the premises need to be in a location easily accessible to customers where they can come and go quickly.

Lynsey Hanson
MA, B.Sc (hons), PGCE, CIAT Affiliate Member
Architectural Technician

Tel: [REDACTED]
E-mail: [REDACTED]
Website: www.lcharchitecturaldesigns.co.uk