

2021/0733 (Planning)
2021/0734 (Listed Building Consent)

Andrew Smith

Replacement windows and addition of dormers and rooflights to dwelling (Planning and Listed Building Consent)

Toll Bar Cottage, Lane Head Road, Cawthorne, Barnsley, S75 4ED

Description and History

Toll Bar Cottage is a stone-built Grade II Listed dwelling and is also set within the newly extended Cawthorne Conservation Area. The cottage was originally the toll bar cottage on the Barnsley to Shepley Lane Head Turnpike. The design and access statement notes that it was built in around 1825 but fell out of use following abolition of the route in 1875. The building is also shown as Dog Kennel Turnpike on the first edition 1850 OS. The list description notes the building is of Mid C19 origin. However, it would seem the core of the building that was the original turnpike house is a minimum of 170 to 200 years old. The core historic building is made of local sandstone and is single storey with a two-cell plan, stone slates to the roof and a twin extended chimney. The later extensions are broadly sympathetic in design and materials.

Regarding the later extensions the dwelling was altered with the addition of a garage in circa 1975 which was subsequently converted to part of the dwelling after 1979 (B/75/3578/PR and B/79/4247/PR). The building has appeared to have evolved in a manner dictated by the conversion of the garage that was subsequently converted to part of the dwelling. As such, little actual design or detailed thought seems to have been given to the relationship of the 70's extension with the historic dwelling, its setting, or its former function and the list description advises this element is not of special interest.





Proposed Development

The applicant is seeking Planning and Listed Building Consent for replacement windows and addition of 2 new dormers and 3 new rooflights to dwelling. The proposed dormers would require planning permission as they are situated on a principal elevation roof slope facing a highway.

The original proposal included a single storey extension, however due to the property being extended previously, the floor area of the extensions was in excess of 100% and not supported by Green Belt Policy. In addition, the Conservation Officer and Cawthorne Parish Council had concerns with regard to the design, therefore this aspect has been removed from the proposal.

Elevation 01 – shows 1 new rooflight to the roof slope

Elevation 02 – shows 1 new dormer to the roof slope

Elevation 03 – shows 2 windows replaced with larger windows and 2 rooflights to the roof slope.

Elevation 04 – shows new doors and 1 new dormer to the roof slope

A Tree Survey was submitted in support of the application.

Policy Context

The new Local Plan was adopted at the full Council meeting held 3rd January 2019 after it was found to be sound by the appointed Planning Inspector following the examination process. This means that it now takes on full weight for decision making process in planning law terms as the development plan for the Borough, superseding the remaining saved policies from the Unitary Development Plan (adopted in the year 2000) and the Core Strategy (adopted in 2011). In reference to this application, the following policies are relevant:

GD1: General development – Proposals for general development will be approved providing there is no significant adverse effect on residential amenity, highway safety, the current or future use of nearby land and it upholds good quality design in accordance with local plan policy D1.

D1: High quality design and place making – This policy sets the overarching design principles for the borough. Development is expected to be of high-quality design and will be expected to respect, take advantage of and reinforce the distinctive, local character and features of the local area.

GB2 – Replacement, extension and alteration of existing buildings within the Green Belt – Provided that the development will not have a harmful impact on the appearance or character and will preserve the openness of the Green Belt, we will allow extension or alteration of a building where the total size of the proposed and previous extensions does not exceed the size of the original building.

HE1: Historic Environment - We will positively encourage developments which will help in the management, conservation, understanding and enjoyment of Barnsley's historic environment, especially for those assets which are at risk.

HE3: Developments Affecting Historic Buildings – Proposals involving additions or alterations to listed buildings or buildings of evident historic significance such as locally listed buildings (or their setting) should seek to conserve and where appropriate enhance that building's significance. In such circumstances proposals will be expected to respect historic precedents of scale, form, massing, architectural detail and the use of appropriate materials that contribute to the special interest of a building.

SPDs:

House Extensions and Other Domestic Alterations
Cawthorne Village Design Statement

Cawthorne Neighbourhood Development Plan – Adopted July 2021

Policy C1 Protecting Local Landscape Character

Policy C7 Heritage and Design in the Conservation Area

NPPF:

The NPPF sets out the Government's planning policies for England and how these are expected to be applied. At the heart is a presumption in favour of sustainable development. Development proposals that accord with the development plan should be approved unless material considerations indicate otherwise. Where the development plan is absent, silent or relevant policies are out-of-date, permission should be granted unless any adverse impacts of doing so would significantly and demonstrably outweigh the benefits, when assessed

against the policies in the Framework as a whole; or where specific policies in the Framework indicate development should be restricted or unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

Consultations

Cawthorne Parish Council – Objected to the original proposal for the following reasons:-

- The heritage statement states that “the private garden side “shed” dormers take a modern approach” The appearance of the standing seam zinc is a contrast to the original and 1970’s part of the dwelling but detracts from the grade II original building.
- The cedar cladding is such a contrast to the stone of the original and 1970’s building that it will detract the Grade II listed building. Although not immediately adjacent it is part of the same building and will be noticeable by its modern approach.
- Barnsley Local Plan Policy HE3 Developments affecting Historic Buildings Proposals involving additions or alterations to listed buildings or buildings of evident historic significance such as locally listed buildings (or their setting) should seek to conserve and where appropriate enhance that building’s significance. In such circumstances proposals will be expected to: Respect historic precedents of scale, form, massing, architectural detail and the use of appropriate materials that contribute to the special interest of a building.
- The modern and totally contrasting use of materials does not respect the historic precedent in use of appropriate materials.
- Cawthorne Neighbourhood Development Plan Policy C7, 2. states that” Extensions to dwellings should be subordinate in scale to the original building and of a design that reinforces the historic character and appearance of the conservation area.
- Although not in the conservation area it is immediately adjacent, and the historic character should be preserved. Policy C7, 8. states that “Materials such as locally quarried coursed stone or rustic brick are characteristic of the village and should be used in new buildings and in alterations to older buildings where appropriate.”. In this context, with the original building and the 1970’s extension being of stone, any further extension should be of stone.
- Cawthorne Parish Council asks that BMBC refuses planning permission for this application.

Conservation Officer – No objection to the amended plans subject to conditions

Tree Officer – No comments received

Representations

None received

Assessment

Principle of development

As the building is set within the Green Belt, the replacement, extension and alteration of existing buildings within the Green Belt is acceptable in principle provided that the development will not have a harmful impact on appearance or character and will preserve the

openness of the Green Belt in accordance with policy GB2 of the Local Plan. GB2 states that we will allow extension or alterations of a building where the total size of the proposed and previous extensions does not exceed the size of the original building. As there are no additional extensions proposed and the additional floorspace would be within the roof space, the proposal is acceptable in accordance with policy GB2.

The main changes relate to design and as the dwelling is a Listed Building and set within the Cawthorne Conservation Area policies HE1 and HE3 are of relevance. These aspects are discussed below within the visual amenity/impact on historic environment section of this report.

Visual Amenity/Impact on Historic Environment

The applicant is seeking Planning and Listed Building Consent for replacement windows and addition of 2 new dormers and 3 new rooflights to dwelling. The proposed dormers would require planning permission as they are situated on a principal elevation roof slope facing a highway. They have been designed with vertical proportions in line with the SPD guidance.

The original proposal included a single storey extension, however due to the property being extended previously, the floor area of the extensions was in excess of 100% and not supported by Green Belt Policy. In addition, the Conservation Officer and Cawthorne Parish Council had concerns with regard to the design, therefore this aspect has been removed from the proposal. The Conservation Officer has been consulted given that the building is Grade II Listed and set within the Cawthorne Conservation Area. The Conservation Officer has provided the following comments to the amended scheme:-

'I support this redesign. The changes are now much more limited to the addition of rooflights and the gable dormers on the north and south roof planes of the later eastern projection. I accept the need to get head room here and although rooflights would have been better, I accept this is a part of the building that has a lesser heritage interest. The redesign indicates stone slates to the roof which I would support (and request) but the rooflights seem like standard Velux. As such I would request these be conservation specific being vertically emphasised, low in profile and black with a single vertical divider.'

In terms of material and window styles, the agent has confirmed:- 'The replacement windows will primarily be timber or PPC aluminium. The client will be looking primarily at engineered timber windows to match. The sliding/folding door to the occasional/living room may end up being White PPC aluminium is a suitable timber engineered solution can't be obtained. Same for the triangular window on the internal facing dormer. The client has requested that an area of these are to open, thus if a suitable engineered timber solution can't be obtained, he would source a PPC aluminium to suit.' – The Conservation Officer has agreed that this is acceptable, subject to conditions. Overall the proposed new windows and doors and the dormer windows are acceptable in terms of the impact upon the Listed Building and the Conservation Area and would preserve the character of the building. The proposal is in compliance with policies HE1, HE3 and D1 of the Local Plan.

Residential Amenity

The dwelling is isolated and there are no immediate neighbours that would be impacted by the proposal therefore the proposal is in accordance with policy GB2 and the SPD House Extensions.

Impact on Trees

Given the nature of the proposal and that there are no extensions to the footprint of the building, there should be no significant impact upon trees.

Recommendation

Approve with conditions