

2021/1370

Mr Doug Smith

Noblethorpe Hall, Barnsley Road, Silkstone, Barnsley, S75 4NG

Erection of 3 car garage

Site Description

Noblethorpe Hall is a grade II listed building located in Silkstone. Noblethorpe Hall is accessed off Barnsley Road (A628). Since the 1940's The Hall and its original curtilage appear to have been repeatedly subdivided. The Hall is now largely severed (in ownership) from the western and northern service areas and the large area of parkland to the east. The building was formerly a hotel but is now in single ownership.

Proposed Development

The applicant is seeking approval for the erection of a garage and acoustic fence. The garage will be located to the southwest of the listed building at a distance of approximately 18 meters. The garage has a length of 11.95 meters and a width of 6.6 meters. The garage will feature a pitched roof with a ridge height of 5.4 meters and an eaves height of 2.8 meters. The materials used will be natural coursed stone and stone slates (to be confirmed by conditions).



N.B.: On 24/01/2022, the proposal was amended. The acoustic fence has been omitted from the application and the small central pedimented gable has been removed from the garage.

Planning History

B/74/0446/PR - Conversion of outbuildings to form offices and toilets (Approve)

B/77/2804/PR - Erect private garage (Historic)

B/80/0955/PR - Change of use from dwelling and office to use as guest house (Relinquished by S.106 Agreement dated 12/09/91) (Approve)

B/84/0813/PR - Erection of private garage (Historic)

B/87/0491/PR - Conversion of existing outbuildings to form self-catering holiday flatlets, provision of additional bedrooms within existing hotel, use of riding school buildings as sports hall, use of land as golf course and conversion of existing building to golf club (Approve)

B/88/1201/PR - (Description unknown) (Historic)

B/91/0917/PR(A) - Alterations to hall and outbuildings to form residential/ telemanagement apartments/houses (Historic)

B/91/0917/PR(B) - Erection of management training centre (Historic)

B/93/0767/PR - Conversion of barns and outbuildings to form five residential units (Historic)

B/B01/0876/PR - (Description unknown) (Historic)

B/01/0905/PR/LB - (Description unknown) (Historic)

B/02/0688/PR - Formation of drive and vehicular access to classified road (Refuse)

B/04/0186/PR/LB - Erection of gates and fencing, cellar steps barrier, cellar grille, two window bars and outside tap to Listed Building (Approve with Conditions)

2011/1287 - Alterations & improvements to existing field access to form new drive & access (Withdrawn)

Policy Context

Planning decisions should be made in accordance with the current development plan policies unless material considerations indicate otherwise. The recently revised National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) does not change the statutory status of the development plan as the starting point for decision making.

Local Plan Allocation – Green Belt

The Barnsley Local Plan (BLP) was adopted at the full Council meeting held 3rd January 2019. In addition, the Local Authority (LPA) has adopted a series of Supplementary Planning Documents (SPD), and Neighbourhood Plans which provide supporting guidance and specific local policies and are a material consideration in the decision-making process. In reference to this application, the following policies are relevant:

Policy SD1: *Presumption in favour of Sustainable Development* – States that proposals for development will be approved where there will be no significant adverse effect on the living conditions and residential amenity of existing and future residents. Development will be expected to be compatible with neighbouring land and will not significantly prejudice the current or future use of neighbouring land. Policy GD1 below will be applied to all development.

Policy GD1: General Development – States that proposals for development will be approved where there will be no significant adverse effect on the living conditions and residential amenity of existing and future residents. Development will be expected to be compatible with neighbouring land and will not significantly prejudice the current or future use of neighbouring land. Policy GD1 below will be applied to all development.

Policy D1: High quality design and place making – Supersedes Core Strategy Policy CSP 29 and sets out the overarching design principles for the borough. Policy D1 States that development is expected to be of high-quality design and will be expected to respect, take advantage of and reinforce the distinctive, local character and features of Barnsley.

Policy HE1: The Historic Environment – States that development which affects the historic environment and Barnsley's heritage assets and their settings will be expected to protect or improve the character and/or appearance of Conservation Areas and Listed Buildings.

Policy HE3: Developments affecting Historic Buildings – Proposals involving historic buildings should conserve and where appropriate enhance, respect historic precedents, and capitalise on opportunities to reveal significance.

Policy GB1: Protection of Green Belt – In accordance with the NPPF, the erection of new buildings within the green belt will be classed as 'inappropriate' development with sites in the green belt being protected from such. Exceptions to this are:

- Buildings for agriculture and forestry;
- Provision of appropriate facilities for outdoor sport, outdoor recreation and for cemeteries;
- The extension or alteration of a building provided that it does not result in disproportionate additions over and above the size of the original building;
- The replacement of a building provided the new building is in the same use and not materially larger than the one it replaces;
- Limited infilling in villages, and limited affordable housing for local community needs; and
- Limited infilling or the partial or complete redevelopment of previously developed sites (brownfield land).

All such buildings will still be considered in terms of their impact on the openness of the green belt and whether they cause other harm.

In accordance with the NPPF and as set out in GB1, the Council will not allow proposals for 'inappropriate' development in the Green Belt unless it can be shown that there are very special circumstances that justify setting aside local and national policy.

Policy GB2: Replacement, extension and alteration of existing buildings in the Green Belt – Provided that it will not have a harmful impact on the appearance, or character and will preserve the openness of the Green Belt, we will allow the following development in the Green Belt:

- Replacement buildings where the new building is in the same use and is not materially larger than that which it replaces;
- Extension or alteration of a building where the total size of the proposed and previous extensions does not exceed the size of the original building;

- Dividing an existing house to form smaller units of accommodation.

All such development will be expected to:

- Be of a high standard of design and respect the character of the existing building and its surroundings, in its footprint, scale and massing, elevation design and materials; and
- Have no adverse effect on the amenity of local residents, the visual amenity of the area, or highway safety.

Supplementary Planning Document: House extensions and Other Domestic Alterations

This document establishes the design principles that specifically apply to the consideration of planning applications for house extensions, roof alterations, outbuildings & other domestic alterations. The general principles are that proposals should;

- Be of a scale and design which harmonises with the existing building;
- Not adversely affect the amenity of neighbouring properties;
- Maintain the character of the street scene; and
- Not interfere with highway safety

The above principles are to reflect the revised principles in the NPPF, which promote high quality design and a good standard of amenity for all existing and future occupants of land and buildings.

National Planning Policy Framework

The NPPF sets out the Government's planning policies and how these are expected to be applied. The core of this is a presumption in favour of sustainable development. Proposals that align with the Local Plan should be approved unless material considerations indicate otherwise. In respect of this application, relevant policies include:

Section 12: Achieving well designed places - The Government attaches great importance to the design of the built environment. Good design is a key aspect of sustainable development, creates better places in which to live and work and helps make development acceptable to communities.

It is important to plan positively for the inclusion of high-quality design for all developments, including individual buildings, public and private spaces and wider area development schemes.

Within section 12, paragraph 134 states that *“development that is not well designed should be refused, especially where it fails to reflect local design policies and government guidance on design, taking into account any local design guidance and supplementary planning documents such as design guides and codes”*.

Consultations

The LPA's Conservation Officer was consulted and raised no objections to the garage element of the application providing the small central pedimented gable that projects slightly forward of the building frontage is to be removed. This has been removed by an amended plan. An objection was raised to the addition of the acoustic fence. This has since been omitted from the application.

Highways Development Control (DC) were consulted and raised no objections.

Pollution Control were consulted and raised no objections.

Silkstone Parish Council were consulted and provided no response.

Representations

Neighbour notification letters were sent to surrounding properties, no comments were received.

Assessment

Principle of Development

The site falls within Green Belt as such, extensions, roof alterations, outbuildings and other domestic alterations will be considered against the general principles from the SPD and the following criteria;

- The total size of the proposed and previous extension should not exceed the size of the original dwelling; and
- The original dwelling must form the dominant visual feature of the dwelling as extended

In addition to the above extensions and alterations to residential properties are considered acceptable where they do not have a detrimental impact on the amenity of surrounding residents, visual amenity and on highway safety, as well as the impact on the setting of the listed building.

Impact on the Green Belt

The starting point to assess extensions and alterations for sites within the Green Belt is identifying how the original dwelling stood in 1948, or whenever the house was built, whichever is later. In this case, the dwelling is shown on the 1948 map. The Hall is a large two-storey dwelling and has a significant footprint which was established pre-1948. The proposed garage is to be 78.87sqm which is inconsequential when compared to the gross floorspace of Noblethorpe Hall.

As such, the proposed garage does not exceed the size of the original dwelling and is in compliance with Local Plan Policy GB2.

Impact on the Listed Building

In line with the consultation response from the LPA's Conservation Officer the proposed garage is inconsequential in terms of its impact on the setting of the listed building. This is because at present there is a small shed in the proposed location but a degree of screening by trees and the fact the plot is set back from the principal elevation allows this location to be suitable.

Moreover, removing parked cars from the eastern frontage into garaging reduces the impact. Also, a three-bay garage in other circumstances would be considered large, however given the size of the Hall, on balance it is not unreasonable. The garage is set, albeit at a distance, against the southern elevation of the Hall and the southern elevation is clearly of lesser architectural quality in comparison to the eastern elevation. Consequently, this is an area of lesser contribution to the setting.

The proposal is considered compliant with Local Plan Policy HE3: Developments affecting Historic Buildings and is considered acceptable in terms of its impact on the setting of the listed building.

Visual Amenity

The SPD states that "*detached garages should relate sympathetically to the main dwelling in style, proportions and external finishes. In most cases, it will not be appropriate for a garage to be sited between the house and the road*". The materials used are suitable for the use and the garage is viewed as a balanced building in terms of the ratio of eaves to ridge heights.

Although the garage is to be set between Noblethorpe Hall and Barnsley Road, the access is not at this point and due to a difference in levels and dense screening adjacent Barnsley Road the impact of this positioning is negated. The garage is to be set back from the highway and not located within a highly prominent position within the street scene. It is therefore deemed that the garage wouldn't have a significant detrimental impact on the character of the street scene.

The proposed development is therefore not considered to be contrary to Local Plan Policy D1: High Quality Design and Place Making and is considered acceptable in terms of visual amenity.

Residential Amenity

The SPD states that "*detached garages should be single storey structures and the eaves height should not normally exceed 2.5m from ground level*", the proposed eaves height exceeds the above recommendation however it is only an increase of 0.3 meters which given the locale and scale of the host dwelling in this circumstance is therefore acceptable.

The proposed garage will not have a significant detrimental impact on any neighbouring property by way of overshadowing or being overbearing. The garage is to be located at significant distances away from the boundaries with the neighbouring dwellings as well as the listed building.

The proposal is considered to be in compliance with Local Plan Policy GD1: General Development and is acceptable in terms of residential amenity.

Highway Safety

There will be no impact upon highway safety.

Recommendation

Approve with conditions